

Research into support for musical progression
for young people from In Harmony
programmes

Phase Two Research:
Action Research and Case Studies

Dr Susan Hallam
Dr Susanne Burns
December 2018

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	3
1. Introduction	9
1.1. Background	9
1.2. Research into support for musical progression	9
1.3. Phase Two Research	10
2. The Research Aims and Methods	12
2.1. Aims	12
2.2. Action Research Interventions	12
2.3. Young Peoples Progression	13
2.4. Development of the framework for future progression tracking	14
3. Young People's Progression: Case Studies	15
3.1. The Case Studies	15
3.2. Factors contributing to successful progression from primary to secondary school	17
3.3. Informal music making	27
3.4. The Challenges	30
3.5. Practices that support and can contribute to the ongoing development of the IH programmes	37
3.6. Overcoming the Challenges	43
4. The Action Research Projects:	48
4.1. The Projects	48
4.2. Tackling the challenges in different ways	51
4.3. Outcomes	52
4.4. Key Learning; What Works	53
4.5. Key Learning: What was less successful	54
4.6. Critical Success Factors	55
5. A framework for the future tracking and evaluation of musical progression by In Harmony participants as they move through secondary school	56
6. Conclusions and Recommendations	58
APPENDICES	59
1. Action Research Projects Evaluation Guide	
2. In Harmony Lambeth Case Study	
3. In Harmony Leeds Case Study	
4. In Harmony Liverpool Case Study	
5. In Harmony Newcastle Case Study	
6. In Harmony Nottingham Case Study	
7. In Harmony Stoke Case Study	
8. In Harmony Telford Case Study	
9. Job Specification for Family Support Worker – Mellers School Nottingham	

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In Harmony was launched in 2008 with three pilot projects for an initial period of two years. In 2012/13, the funding responsibility for *In Harmony* shifted to Arts Council England (ACE) and a decision was made to continue to fund two of the initial pilots, Liverpool and Lambeth. In 2012, four new programmes were initiated: Telford and Stoke, Nottingham, Newcastle Gateshead and Leeds. Over time the core principles of *In Harmony* have evolved to reflect how the six programmes operate in their different settings. Each project is distinct and they are all bespoke to their specific contexts but share common principles.

In 2017, research was commissioned by Opera North, one of the six lead organisations of *In Harmony* programmes, funded by an evaluation grant from ACE to examine musical progression as the young people progressed from primary school into secondary education. The research was carried out by Dr Sue Hallam, respected music education academic, currently based at the UCL Institute of Education and Susanne Burns, a management consultant specialising in the arts sector. '*Research into support for musical progression for young people in In Harmony Programmes*' was published in 2017. Based on interviews with children, schools, parents and data from the projects, the findings were supported by a detailed literature review into musical progression across a range of programmes internationally; examining social, educational and musical factors and their impact on continued musical participation and learning. Recommendations were made based on existing practice, showing how challenges and barriers to continued musical progression can be overcome through support from families, schools, music education infrastructure and programmes such as *In Harmony*.

Hallam and Burns recommended that further research be undertaken to:

- Ensure that all programmes are gathering consistent data on progression beyond primary school enabling comparisons to be made and engendering a more accurate picture of retention patterns;
- Map out the journeys of young people as they transition as it is clear that some young people continue their musical journeys informally or through other providers;
- Test potential strategies that might support transition but that have not yet been trialled.

ACE commissioned each *In Harmony* programme to develop and implement an action research project putting the recommendations of the report into practice and testing potential solutions to supporting musical progression. The aims of the action research were to explore approaches to enhancing the successful progression of children into extra-curricular activities while at primary school, at the transition from primary to secondary school and as they transition from Key Stage 3 to Key Stage 4.

Alongside this, a second phase of research was also commissioned that would evaluate the action research programmes and also further the initial research by developing a series of case studies of individual young people to demonstrate the initial findings.

Case Studies

19 case studies of individual young people shed light on the earlier findings. It is apparent from the 19 case studies presented that **a range of factors contribute to supporting successful progression**. These illuminate the earlier research rather than providing new data. They include:

- Good home school liaison and pastoral support can support progression;
- Proactive family support is crucial but there is a need for a balance between this and the need to generate independence;
- Professional Musicians acting as role models and mentors;
- Sibling support and modelling appears to be an important motivating factor;

- Where there are social elements to the activity provided young people are motivated to continue to take part;
- Where out of school activity is available at an early age, young people appear to become more independent participants taking greater responsibility and agency;
- Cross agency/ partnership working supports progression;
- Logistical and financial support mitigates against the barriers faced by many families;
- There is evidence that being ‘pushed’ hard to achieve motivates and helps to support progression.

Similarly, the stories illustrate the **barriers and challenges** that young people face in continuing with their involvement which were outlined in depth in the earlier research.

- Opportunities may be there but the power to take them is not within the control of the young person;
- Logistical barriers such as money, travel, the location of the secondary school or the time the school day ends are common and recurrent and again, often not within the control of the young person;
- Provision may not be available – and when it is, the style and approach may be different or the provision may be too elementary for the musical stage of development so it does not meet the needs of the young person;
- Complex and challenging home circumstances can be barriers to progression;
- Lack of parental engagement and support or even passive support is often a barrier.

Action Research Projects

Seven Action Research projects took place between January and September 2018. The projects were very different and met needs identified locally. Full case studies of each project are contained in the appendices.

In Harmony Lambeth

Lambeth tested two interventions:

- A Summer Orchestral Holiday Course – 7th – 10th August 2018 - for 30 year 6 students bridging between primary and secondary school which will focus on building closer relationships with parents/ carers in preparation for progression to secondary school in September 2018.
- A formal Youth Voice programme between February and July 2018.

Areas of Focus:

- Create opportunities for young people to feed into future plans for *In Harmony* to empower them and increase the likelihood that they are successful;
- Be connected and have extensive partnerships with other local providers of music education opportunities.

In Harmony Leeds

Leeds developed Opera North Junior Strings which was launched in January 2018 and was open to string players aged 10 – 14 across Leeds. The ensemble sought to support the development of outstanding musicianship, and offered *In Harmony* players the opportunity to develop a positive musical identity outside of their local area and make social networks with children from across Leeds in their final year of primary school. In addition, the running costs of minibuses were supported which enabled the children pursuing extra curricular activity outside of their immediate local area.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for *In Harmony* and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways;
- Provide subsidies, transport and logistical support where necessary.

In Harmony Liverpool

Liverpool tested two interventions:

- An intensive weekend Chamber Music course - building on pathways available to support young musicians, a weekend, intensive chamber course for *In Harmony* young musicians playing at Grade 4+ equivalent level;
- A pilot Pre-Associate membership scheme for individual young musicians - As part of Liverpool Philharmonic's commitment to encouraging progression in orchestral music making, Associate Membership of Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Orchestra is available to aspiring *In Harmony* musicians. The pilot **Pre-Associate Membership Scheme** for 3-4 identified *In Harmony* young musicians aims to drive individual skill, confidence and musical progression for *In Harmony* participants who have already reached a Grade 4* equivalent level and need additional resources to quicken their progress to the next level.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for In Harmony and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways;
- Offer pastoral support to young people;
- Provide subsidies, transport and logistical support where necessary.

In Harmony Newcastle Gateshead

Newcastle Gateshead worked in partnership with the regional Music Partnership North (Music Education Hub) to track musical progression and development post year 6. It was believed that the hub would provide greater access to information and enhanced communication with secondary schools. At the same time the team wished to pilot ways to track year 6 leavers.

Areas of Focus:

- Be connected and have partnerships with other local providers of music education opportunities;
- Be connected and have strong relationships with secondary schools where this is possible and have knowledge of the musical opportunities that they offer.

In Harmony Nottingham

Nottingham led a pilot project between January and October 2018 that sought to support musical progression and to create musical communities for young people outside of school with the aim of increasing the numbers of secondary age young people in Nottingham City engaging in music making:

- Identify 2 pilot schools and cohorts of year 5 and 6 pupils;
- Recruit a family support worker in each school;
- Hold a series of sharing and play events for families and siblings of targeted cohorts;
- Invite cohorts to join Area Band, RHYO Connect or RHYO Intermediate (as appropriate);

- Provide transport and supervision for children attending each of the groups;
- Facilitate meetings with secondary school music teachers introducing the specific cohort of pupils and families to their new school, music department and opportunities;
- Hold discussions with schools, pupils and families to evaluate the impact;
- Prepare Youth Music funding application to roll out the programme to the wider group of IH schools.

Areas of Focus:

- Offer pastoral support to young people;
- Provide subsidies, transport and logistical support where necessary;
- Be able to advise and support young people and their parents in making decisions about which musical progression opportunities to pursue;
- Be connected and have strong relationships with secondary schools where this is possible and have knowledge of the musical opportunities that they offer.
- Be tenacious in following up non-attendance in students recently transferred to secondary school
- Provide information to parents about the musical opportunities in local secondary schools

In Harmony Stoke

Stoke tested the development of an out of school orchestra based at Thistley Hough Academy. This orchestra built on best practice from *In Harmony* Telford and the successful orchestra that takes place at Old Park Primary. The orchestra was open to all pupils in Year 7 and 8 and Loquela (EAL unit) taking part in *In Harmony* with different playing abilities catered for. The new *In Harmony* orchestra was led by 3 members of In Harmony staff so that each instrumental discipline is catered for. The orchestra was also developed so that feeder primary school pupils were invited and links between KS2 - 3 are developed. School staff were also involved in the sessions, that upskilled non instrumental specialist music teachers.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for In Harmony and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways

In Harmony Telford

Telford tested a twofold approach:

- A short **Chamber Ensemble course** for the most engaged Year 5 and 6s which provided more performance opportunities. In 2017, a pilot Chamber Ensemble project took place for the most engaged Year 5s and 6s in the programme to inspire them to continue when they transitioned to secondary school. The project culminated in 4 performances in the local area at care homes and at the school fete. The pilot will include a similar project with a new cohort, learning from what we did last year, as they found that this was useful for retention and feeding into the Nucleo Orchestra and Youth Ensemble. The team were also seeking other opportunities for the Chamber Ensemble to perform in the same setting as the Youth Ensemble, to make the progression route visible to Chamber Ensemble members, and inspire them to continue on their instrument.
- Increase the number of rehearsals for the **In Harmony Youth Ensemble** to provide greater continuity. This ensemble is the first permanent ensemble to be run which children join on teacher recommendation only, once they reach a certain level of proficiency on their instrument. As Telford doesn't have any youth orchestras or ensembles for the children in the programme to progress to, this ensemble is intended to be the main vehicle for progression from the mixed ability ensembles. The pilot will be used to ensure the Youth Ensemble runs for 10 weeks per term, bringing greater continuity to the rehearsal period.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for *In Harmony* and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways

Outcomes of the Action Research projects can be grouped as follows:

- Improved musical, social and leadership skills;
- Commitment to continued involvement;
- Wider friendship networks and the creation of music-making peer groups and support networks in individual schools and across them;
- Greater parental involvement and increased understanding of opportunities by families;
- Children have better understanding of the range of pathways available to them;
- Provision has been embedded.

Key learning has been extrapolated and the following strategies and approaches appear to have been effective:

- **Family Liaison and Support** is an effective way to support young people and breaks down many barriers to engagements as well as building parental understanding, engagement and support.
- **Engaging Parents early in the programme**
Play sessions worked well in Nottingham but it might just be about an open invitation to observe a session or a letter home, informal conversations build trust and confidence and that will be crucial.
- **Setting high expectations and striving for higher playing standards**
Several projects adopted approaches to accelerating progression. Several were selective - which runs against the inclusivity of the *In Harmony* programmes in primary school - but this appears to support progression as it is motivating. Other projects referred to setting progression targets that push the young person whilst recognizing that individual circumstances often mean that a flexible approach needs to be taken and setting high expectations of what can be achieved and offering opportunities for accreditation/validation of achievement.
- **Summer holiday courses** that bridge between primary and secondary school and focus on transition.
- **Partnership working** – especially with the secondary schools and the Music Education Hubs - and across teams where appropriate supports the development of diverse pathways. Projects cited a wide variety of other partners including London Music Masters, the MEHs, the Ruth Gorse Academy in Leeds as well as internal partners such as the Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Orchestra.
- Providing **ensembles that span a wide range of year groups or across provision** can be an effective approach.
- **Logistical Support** – Leeds provided minibuses to transport young people.
- **Small cohorts - chamber and small ensemble provision** are approaches that proved effective across several projects. There also is a value in investing in **1 to 1 lessons** - with targeted goals as this can really accelerate progression.

- **‘Reunions’ and other social events** that provide opportunities for young people to come along, reconnect with each other and talk informally with tutors.

In Harmony is a unique long-term intervention and as a site of learning it is rich and deep. Much can be learned from the programme to inform other music education interventions as well as other art form based interventions. This two part research programme has examined musical progression from primary to secondary through multiple lenses. A literature review was carried out which then led to an extensive research programme and report published in Autumn 2017. This report reflects a more practice based research approach of case studies of individual children that highlight the earlier research along with some action research projects.

The work has highlighted several things:

- The power of peer to peer learning within the *In Harmony* network and how a focus for a somewhat disparate group – in this case, secondary progression - can generate rich and deep learning, shared and next practice;
- How small amounts of funding – in this case £5k - can enable risk taking and experimentation and generate new solutions to challenges being faced;
- How small steps can contribute to a larger change within programmes.

It is recommended that the network consider further areas of inquiry that concern them all and set aside small sums each year within budgets for action research programmes/ risk in areas of mutual interest.

We have suggested a core set of quantitative indicators that may help to develop some consistency across the programmes across 2017/18 which can inform the national evaluation and be revised for 2018/19.

However, from a more quantitative perspective, it is suggested that the following might be achievable within resources:

- The Case Study children interviewed for this research could continue to be tracked by the projects and that projects might like to consider producing more case studies of individual children;
- The reunion event that *In Harmony* held in Newcastle Gateshead might be something that other projects want to adapt and adopt as a means of staying in touch with the young people who move on;
The children who have taken part in the action research projects should be tracked to assess long term effectiveness of the interventions.

1. Introduction

1.1. Background

In Harmony was launched in 2008 with three pilot projects for an initial period of two years. In 2012/13, the funding responsibility for *In Harmony* shifted to Arts Council England (ACE) and a decision was made to continue to fund two of the initial pilots, Liverpool and Lambeth. In 2012, four new programmes were initiated: Telford and Stoke, Nottingham, Newcastle and Leeds. Over time the core principles of *In Harmony* have evolved to reflect how the six programmes operate in their different settings. National Foundation for Educational Research (NFER)/ ACE have defined them as:

- a focus on areas of deprivation and low engagement;
- a demand-led, committed whole school approach;
- immersive and intensive activity;
- alignment with music education hubs / integration within music education hubs;
- professional musicians, ensembles and orchestras working with schools;
- high profile performance opportunities;
- continuity and progression for children;
- access to instruments;
- the sharing of expertise and resources.

Change within the wider community may result in the long term, but is not a primary focus for ACE/Department for Education (DfE) as funders. A range of independent evaluations of individual *In Harmony* programmes have been carried out and one national evaluation (2013-2016). These have found evidence of the positive impact on the personal, social and musical development of participating young people.

1.2. Research into support for musical progression

In 2017, research was commissioned by Opera North, one of the six lead organisations of *In Harmony* programmes, funded by an evaluation grant from ACE to examine musical progression as the young people progressed from primary school into secondary education. The research was carried out by Dr Sue Hallam, respected music education academic, currently based at the UCL Institute of Education and Dr Susanne Burns, a management consultant specialising in the arts sector. '*Research into support for musical progression for young people in In Harmony Programmes*' was published in 2017.

Based on interviews with children, schools, parents and data from the projects, the findings were supported by a detailed literature review into musical progression across a range of programmes internationally; examining social, educational and musical factors and their impact on continued musical participation and learning. Recommendations were made based on existing practice, showing how challenges and barriers to continued musical progression

can be overcome through support from families, schools, music education infrastructure and programmes such as *In Harmony*.

Key findings of the research were summarised as follows:

- *Young people continuing with their musical activities in secondary school and during GCSE studies loved music, had strong musical identities, had a social life related to music and were committed young musicians.*
- *This had been achieved by the In Harmony programmes which provided a wide range of inclusive, musical activities in a supportive environment and opportunities for performance and engagement with other young musicians.*
- *In Harmony staff are key in developing strong, supportive relationships with young people, to inspire and motivate them and guide them in the decisions they make about their musical progression.*
- *It was important to engage parents early on and maintain their support. Regular contact, meetings and other communications were crucial.*
- *Musical progression opportunities at secondary school were generally limited and where available were often inappropriate. The lack of a positive musical culture led to negative peer pressure and sometimes bullying. Most progression was through extra-curricular activities.*
- *There were financial challenges in providing instrumental lessons at secondary level despite the availability of the pupil premium.*
- *Extra-curricular activities needed to take account of location and access. Finding suitable, affordable accommodation for activities and concerts was challenging.*
- *To ensure appropriate musical activities for all young people required partnerships with other music education organisations, particularly Music Education Hubs which have responsibility for providing appropriate and affordable progression opportunities in their area.*
- *The In Harmony programmes are at various stages of development. They face different challenges. They can learn from sharing their experiences as part of ongoing professional development opportunities.*
- *There is no quick fix to ensuring musical progression. Each In Harmony programme needs to identify the challenges for the young people and families in its communities and through consultation with them attempt to resolve the issues.*
- *It is not sufficient to provide progression opportunities for young people from very deprived communities, it is necessary to recognise the barriers and attempt to remove them.*

(Hallam & Burns, 2017, p 4)

1.3. Phase Two Research

Hallam and Burns recommended that further research be undertaken to:

- Ensure that all programmes are gathering consistent data on progression beyond primary school enabling comparisons to be made and engendering a more accurate picture of retention patterns;
- Map out the journeys of young people as they transition as it is clear that some young people continue their musical journeys informally or through other providers;
- Test potential strategies that might support transition but that have not yet been trialled.

ACE commissioned each *In Harmony* programme to develop and implement an action

research project putting the recommendations of the report into practice and testing potential solutions to supporting musical progression.

The aims of the action research were to explore approaches to enhancing the successful progression of children into extra-curricular activities while at primary school, at the transition from primary to secondary school and as they transition from Key Stage 3 to Key Stage 4.

Each programme selected at least one area of the recommendations set out below for its focus.

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for In Harmony and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways
- Offer pastoral support to young people
- Provide subsidies, transport and logistical support where necessary
- Create opportunities for young people to feed into future plans for In Harmony to empower them and increase the likelihood that they are successful
- Be connected and have extensive partnerships with other local providers of music education opportunities
- Have extensive knowledge of what musical opportunities are available for young people in the area
- Be able to advise and support young people and their parents in making decisions about which musical progression opportunities to pursue
- Be tenacious in following up non-attendance in students recently transferred to secondary school
- Be connected and have strong relationships with secondary schools where this is possible and have knowledge of the musical opportunities that they offer
- Provide information to parents about the musical opportunities in local secondary schools
- Provide a homework club and food and drinks prior to extra-curricular activities
- Have extensive local knowledge about funds which may be available to support young people and their families in pursuing these activities
- Offer practical guidance as to how to access funding to take up these opportunities
- Have an active role in recruiting funders/donors to support young people's ongoing progression

Alongside this, a second phase of research was also commissioned that would evaluate the action research programmes and also further the initial research by developing a series of case studies of individual young people to demonstrate the initial findings.

This report outlines the findings of both elements of the follow up work. It presents 19 case studies of individual young people which shed light on the earlier findings. It also presents 7 case studies of the action research programmes and compares the outcomes of each project on the progression and retention of the participating young people. The report comments on the strengths and weaknesses of each of the initiatives and makes recommendations for the future that might inform the national evaluation being carried out in 2018/19. It also presents an outline framework for the future tracking and evaluation of musical progression by *In Harmony* participants as they move through secondary school.

2. The Research Aims and Methods

2.1. Aims

The work was designed to build on the findings of the report prepared by Dr Sue Hallam and Dr Susanne Burns into musical progression by children from the six *In Harmony* programmes and other comparable programmes, which was published in Autumn 2017.

The overarching aims of this second phase of work were to:

- Evaluate the effectiveness of the action research interventions to support progression which are being carried out based on the recommendations and findings of the report;
- Build on the knowledge of effective practice and challenges in enabling musical progression by young people facing significant deprivation through a series of case studies of at least one young person from each project;
- Develop a framework for the future tracking and evaluation of musical progression by *In Harmony* participants as they move through secondary school.

The specific research questions were framed around the learning from the earlier research.

- What factors contribute to successful progression and how can these be illustrated through individual stories?
- What are the barriers to successful progression and how can we address these barriers?
- How can the projects more effectively track musical progression by *In Harmony* participants as they move through secondary school?

2.2. Action Research Interventions

The aim of the action research was to explore ways to enhance the successful progression of children into extra-curricular activities while at primary school, at the transition from primary to secondary school and as they transition from Key Stage 3 to Key Stage 4.

A framework was developed for the action research ensuring that it is possible to set out the findings from the six projects in a comparable form enabling recommendations to be made.

The framework consisted of:

- A simple self evaluation template which will be completed at the onset of the action research projects;
- A final case study of the project that was implemented produced at the end of the project which follows a template and which will reflect the evaluation material gathered.

The evaluation framework;

- Focussed on process;
- Focussed on reflection and learning;
- Was simple and embedded in the project;
- Involved cross project reflection through a meeting in July 2018 when some projects had been completed.

The learning was informed by the following questions:

- What worked and what didn't work?
- Is this an effective way of supporting musical progression?
- How did the project work and was this effective in generating better outcomes?

- What processes were involved? What can we learn from this about designing future projects?
- Could your project be sustainable in the long term?
- What might we do differently?

The research then drew on the outcomes of each project to comment on the strengths and weaknesses of each of the initiatives and make recommendations for the future.

2.3. Young people's progression

This research aims to:

- Provide insights into what factors contribute to the progression of young people participating in *In Harmony* with a particular focus on what supports transferring to secondary school and transferring between Key Stage 3 and Key Stage 4;
- Provide insights into what might lead to children and young people who are participating or who have participated in *In Harmony* to dropping out of formal musical activities;
- Provide insights into the informal music making which young people who had previously participated in *In Harmony* may engage with including those who are continuing to make music formally and those who are not;
- To highlight any specific challenges faced by the young people;
- To highlight successful practices which can contribute to the ongoing development of the *In Harmony* programmes in terms of the progression of the participating young people.

The objectives are to:

- individually interview a sample of young people from each of the six *In Harmony* programmes and track their musical activities over a period of two terms;
- identify the challenges that they face in participating in musical activities;
- identify what might have supported them in continuing their musical progression;
- identify any specific events or factors which might have influenced any young people who might have given up their musical activities
- highlight successful models which can be shared between projects and strengthen *In Harmony* nationally, and models that can be shared with Hubs and other music education bodies;
- deliver a report with findings and recommendations for action.

The aims and objectives were met by:

- conducting individual interviews with at least one young person from each *In Harmony* programme;
- where possible, triangulating this interview with interviews with family and musical tutors;
- asking each programme to suggest young people who were willing to be interviewed;
- analysing the data from the interviews in terms of patterns and recurring themes;
- producing a series of case studies that provide snapshots of individual stories.

Each case study followed a similar structure.

- A short opening paragraph highlights the relevance of the case study to the findings of the earlier research;
- A profile of the young person – their age, *In Harmony* experience, relevant home/ circumstances/ background/ siblings, school that they progressed to and its musical provision;

- Their *In Harmony* Journey
 - What is their ongoing engagement with music/ *In Harmony*?
 - What have they taken part in?
 - What were the challenges for them and how were these overcome?
 - What has taking part in *In Harmony* given them/meant to them?
 - Has it made a difference other than music?
 - How have their parents/ carers supported this journey?
- Into the Future
 - What are their longer term ambitions and aspirations?
 - How do their parents/ carers/ musical tutors see this panning out? Is it realistic? Do they see issues and challenges? How will they support it?

2.4. **Development of the framework for future progression tracking**

A framework will be prepared for the future tracking and evaluation of musical progression by *In Harmony* participants as they move through secondary school. This will draw on existing data collection approaches adopted by *In Harmony* teams and other available progression tracking frameworks.

3. Young People’s Progression: Case Studies

3.1. The Case Studies

A total of 19 case studies have been developed and are summarised in the table below. The young people ranged from 11 – 20 years old and in most cases the interviews involved parents and musicians as well as the young person themselves in order to view the stories through different lenses. It was interesting that this did not reveal any major discrepancies between the perceptions of each party but rather there was considerable consensus. In some cases sibling groups were also involved.

The two researchers followed a common template for the interviews and the case studies and it would be fair to say that although the research did not unearth any radically new material to the earlier research it illuminated it by bringing it to life.

Pupil	Subject Matter	Learning
1	<i>Progression to out of school provision before moving to secondary school supports ongoing engagement. Family support combined with the support of the In Harmony team and the financial support of a grant for attending the Centre for Advanced Training (CAT) are also major factors which have supported ongoing engagement with music.</i>	Importance of financial support alongside parental support makes progression possible
2	<i>Different motivations can drive ongoing engagement and partnership working across agencies can also support progression.</i>	Importance of cross agency support – In Harmony is not working alone for outcomes
3	<i>Family support is crucial to continued progression and transitioning to out of school provision prior to secondary school helps to support continuing engagement.</i>	Whole family support
4	<i>In Harmony can support whole families, some of the members of which might have complex problems. At the same time In Harmony can also support aspiring, talented young musicians.</i>	Whole family support and impact
5	<i>Challenges can arise when young people transfer to secondary school after leaving an In Harmony primary school in terms of limited opportunities and dealing with bullying. It also illustrates how IH can inspire young people to want to pursue a career in music and can offer support to the young person and the family.</i>	Limited opportunities and bullying are major challenges
6	<i>In Harmony supported a young person whose mother died and who then had to go and live with her father with whom she had previously had limited contact. The family situation was further complicated as she also has a brother with very severe autism. IH provided stability and activities after school which gave opportunities for friendship and self-expression.</i>	In Harmony can provide stability in sometimes troubled lives
7	<i>In Harmony in a secondary school can enhance musical learning for students who have strong non-musical career aspirations and provide them with skills for music becoming a hobby.</i>	Informal music making/ music as hobby
8	<i>A young person can be supported by In Harmony as he learns to adjust to living in a new country where he does not speak the language. It also demonstrates how</i>	In Harmony contributing to resettlement/ informal music making

	<i>engagement with In Harmony can provide the basis for learning music in a different genre.</i>	
9	<i>In Harmony plays an important role in supporting musical development in a low attaining child who has difficulties with retention and concentration and who is also in receipt of the Pupil Premium.</i>	<i>In Harmony and low attainment</i>
10	<i>Participation in In Harmony opened up the opportunity to go to a specialist performing arts school. It also demonstrates how the continuity of musical activities supported difficulties in transition and coping with bullying and developed a range of other musical, personal and social skills.</i>	<i>In Harmony supporting difficulties in transition</i>
11	<i>Parental encouragement can be crucial in maintaining engagement when interest wanes. Even young people who have considerable potential and enjoy music and performing can have times when they do not want to participate. For parents it is important to get the balance right between encouragement and domination. In the long term the latter can be counter-productive. Motivation needs to be intrinsic.</i>	<i>Importance of parental support</i>
12	<i>How a Year 6 pupil can be supported to engage out of school at an early stage to support the transition to secondary school and the importance of family support in this process.</i>	<i>Out of school involvement needs to start early</i>
13	<i>How a Family Support Worker can enable and support ongoing participation in In Harmony for a young man and his family encountering significant challenges.</i>	<i>Passive v active parental support</i>
14	<i>The problems faced when opportunities are available but the child is unable to choose to take them because of family circumstances and parental choices that are preventing progression.</i>	<i>Opportunities require freedom of choice to be able to take them up; Lack of awareness of the music offer in different secondary schools mitigates against informed choice</i>
15	<i>The importance of parental support and the tricky balance between protectiveness and developing independence. In addition, the need to nurture and support out of school involvement at the earliest opportunity to cultivate that independence.</i>	<i>Proactive nature of parental support but balanced with the need to generate independence</i>
16	<i>The impact on a sibling group of participating in In Harmony and how music has affected life chances, aspiration and choices. The eldest may no longer be playing but has a lifelong love of music and it has changed his life in many different ways. The importance of the role models provided by the music tutors is also evident.</i>	<i>Progression in 'life' as well as 'music'; sibling group impact; the importance of 'side by side' and role models.</i>
17	<i>The importance of the role played by professional musicians as well as the support of parents.</i>	<i>Importance of the role of professional musicians</i>
18	<i>Transfer to secondary school can create issues for attendance at In Harmony activities, how practising at home can be problematic and how music can become a career option when other avenues are no longer possible.</i>	<i>Attendance challenges</i>
19	<i>The crucial importance of the social elements of In Harmony, while also providing sufficient challenge in</i>	<i>Importance of social elements</i>

	<i>terms of repertoire to maintain the interest of young people. In Harmony also provides a safe place where parents feel confident that their children are engaged in something worthwhile.</i>	
--	--	--

3.2. Factors contributing to successful progression from primary to secondary school

The original research had highlighted that factors contributing to successful progression from primary to secondary school included:

- Offering extra-curricular activities early on. Participation in these activities generated the self-motivation that was critical to developing resilience and ongoing engagement;
- Following transition to secondary school, it was found to be important to follow up and contact young people who did not return to the programme;
- Parents needed to understand the importance of engaging with the extra-curricular activities;
- Support from the *In Harmony* teams who provided transport when parents could not, maintained personal contact particularly through the transfer to secondary school and had strong positive relationships with young people;
- The importance of performance opportunities in engaging the young people and their parents;
- Holiday courses were important in enhancing motivation, as were opportunities to engage with other young musicians from around the UK and internationally. The involvement of professional musicians supported progression;
- Excellent relationships with partner and progression organisations were critical to young people's progression;
- Parents and students needed information about career and progression opportunities;

The following case studies of individual children highlight these factors.

Case Study 1: Pupil H

The case study of H illustrates how progressing to out of school provision before moving to secondary school can support ongoing engagement. Family support combined with the support of the In Harmony team and the financial support of a grant for attending the Centre for Advanced Training (CAT) are also major factors which have supported H's ongoing engagement with music.

H is now in year 10 and attending the local Academy where the majority of the *In Harmony* pupils attend. She is a very talented oboe player and has now been playing for 5 years. She has a younger brother who is currently in year 2 and playing violin. H attends orchestra twice a week and is also a member of the CAT Wind Band. In June 2018 she performed one of her ABRSM Grade 5 pieces on the concourse as part of the Great Exhibition of the North, also giving a lovely speech about her experiences of the *In Harmony* project and learning the oboe.

H's In Harmony Journey

"I didn't know what classical music was at the beginning and it was very scary"

H's journey started in Year 4/5 when she chose to learn to play the oboe: *"I liked the sound of it and still do."* Since then she has progressed rapidly and is clearly a very talented player. She joined the Centre Advanced Training in Year 6, before progressing to secondary school.

She continues to attend and passed her Grade 4 examination in the winter of 2018 and is progressing to Grade 5.

H has attended two Sistema residentials: *“I had never been away from home before and it was a bit scary not just because I was away from my Mam and Dad but because I had to share a dorm with 12 other people who I didn’t know. But it was great – we talked about our experiences.”*

H recently did a video audition for the Sistema Europe Youth Orchestra, and gained a place on their summer course.

Her confidence has grown exponentially since she started to play and this has been helped by being in so many different social circles and meeting people with different lifestyles and from different backgrounds. *“She can talk to people now – it brought her out of her shell. She is more open you know – it helped her grow up a little bit. She is more independent and has been to new places without us.”*

The move from Primary School to Secondary was a *“big change”* - *“I was starting again, having to make new friends and it was big!”* – but at no point did H feel that she would give up her music. Interestingly, she talked about the convenience of her instrument on the bus – *“It might have been different if I had had a huge instrument to carry on the bus!”*

In her Secondary School, there is an option to study music at GCSE but H has not opted to take it: *“They work more with voices than with instruments and I find that boring. I already knew what they were teaching us and so I wasn’t learning anything new.”*

H has worked with the same music tutor since she started with In Harmony and clearly feels that this consistency, continuity and familiarity has been important to her. *“When R took maternity leave, her partner took over my lessons and this meant he knew where I was up to and when to push me and not to.”*

Her father spoke about how the family supports her: *“If she needs support we’re there to give it but we don’t need to push her. She has chosen to continue playing after primary school. She chooses to attend at the weekend and to attend out of school. We can hear her progressing.”*

“Ours is not really a musical household, we are not musicians ourselves so this is outside of our comfort zone. I wouldn’t even have know what an oboe is before this started.”

H receives a grant as she is a member of the CAT and it is unlikely that without this support she would be able to continue to be as involved as she is. *“A taxi picks her up and takes her to CAT so we can get on with other things. Without the grant nothing would have happened. We wouldn’t have been able to afford it. The Summer Schools have also been supported so we have been very lucky to have these opportunities.”*

Apart from this financial support, the support of the In Harmony team is clearly also critical: *“If I don’t want to do something L puts my mind at rest. Summer School for starters – I didn’t want to do it last year but she calmed me down. None of us had been a plane before and that was scary. Her Dad reinforces this from the parental perspective: “We are supporting her as much as we can from home but without the support of the In Harmony team this wouldn’t be enough. Both are necessary. They need us to push at home and we need them.”*

Into the Future

Into the medium term both H and her parents can see there might be challenges when she reaches her GCSE examinations due to pressure of work. H herself however is very grounded:

“Playing helps me to relax – I can zone out and chill – it helps me unwind. So I feel it will be the opposite. I think playing will help me deal with any stress from the exams.”

H had always wanted to be a Forensic Scientist but she stated that she had dropped this idea as she was not sure she wanted to go to University. She wants to work with people and said she may pursue the police force or may work to become a music teacher. She is developing her leadership skills within the Symphony Orchestra and supports the team. She has a mature and thoughtful attitude to her life chances and is clearly grounded and confident in her own ideas and opinions. Her parents would love her to go to University but are clearly allowing her to find her own way.

She is currently doing some work experience with the *In Harmony* team as well as work experience with an organisation that provides 1:1 support to young people who are having problems often young immigrants struggling to settle into the new environment. According to her Dad: *“She could not have done either of these things without the confidence that In Harmony has given her to get involved with other people. It doesn’t matter how rich or poor you are you will have better chances when you have these experiences.”*

Case Study 12: Pupil V

The case study of V illustrates how a year 6 pupil can be supported to engage out of school at an early stage to support the transition to secondary school and demonstrates the importance of family support in this process.

V is now in year 6 and has been learning trombone since year 4. She is a very talented player, very chatty and bright and has a younger sibling and a Polish mother who is extremely supportive. At home the family speak Polish. She will be progressing to secondary in September 2018 and intends to continue playing.

V is part of the pilot project being tested by *In Harmony* to assist young people who the team feel need additional support to transition to secondary school. This entails the support of a Family Support Worker, fun sessions with parents and support to attend the Youth Orchestra.

V’s In Harmony Journey

“I started playing in year 4 and I loved it straight away. I am now in the area band and have joined Youth Orchestra– we have a concert at the end of June. I attended Band Camp last year and loved that –there were loads of activities outside and it was fun and I made new friends.”

Parental support has been crucial to V’s progress. As her music tutor says, *“her mum values what is happening and does everything she can to support her. She actively engages with us and will always push for information, answers and solutions.”*

Her Aunt in Poland is a professional violinist and is very proud of her nieces in the UK but this is the only musical background in the family.

Her involvement out of school has meant she has made much faster progress. Her mother states: *“Area Band was OK but she got bored. Youth Orchestra Connect and Intermediate are different to the bands as they are pushed harder and make more progress. They are expected to do more and it is more challenging so they spend more time on harder material and techniques. It is good for her and it has boosted her confidence.”*

V chose the trombone much to her mother's initial anguish: *"Oh my goodness, why did she choose a trombone?"* But, she loves it now and recently attended a family session which was organised by the In Harmony team that involved parents being taught by their child. She enjoyed this and said it had helped her to understand more about what it meant to be playing at the level V now is.

V had recently sat her Grade 1 exam but failed: *"something went wrong. Her nerves kicked in so we are now offering more practice sessions and she will do her Grade 2 before the summer. She is good enough but it is all about the confidence."*

Confidence is an issue for V according to her mother - *"If something goes wrong she closes down. Teachers need to make her open up so it worries me a little that at secondary school she won't have that one teacher watching out for her, know what I mean?"*

"Music brings me happiness – the teachers are kind – it gives me more confidence." She articulates the reluctance of many year 6 pupils to leave the comfort of their primary school: *"I wish I could stay here forever."*

She struggles with the social side of school – she is quiet and doesn't make friends easily – *"She struggles with friendships - so music has helped her with this. Orchestra has been an opportunity to engage with children playing at the same level but outside of the primary school and the move to secondary school will provide her with a new start."* (Music Tutor)

When V transitions to secondary school, she will have two bus journeys from home and a long walk – *"I have to get off the bus and go on my legs"* – it is possible that this will mitigate against her continued involvement. V anticipates that music will be different at secondary school. She thinks there may be different instruments being taught and that the timings will not coincide with those of her out of school groups. She is also concerned about transport to and from her out of school music provision. On the positive side she is looking forward to making new friends and is committed to doing well in her academic studies. She has many interests and is a talented swimmer. She attends Polish Club and does dance and acrobatics as well as music.

She had wanted a different school but was not allocated a place and a failed appeal meant she was allocated to a school she would not have chosen. Her mother is already in contact with the Principal to request an exemption that would allow V to leave school early on Mondays so she is able to attend Youth Orchestra. Our home mantra is *"nothing is impossible, never give up, fall, stand up, chin up."*

Into the Future

The connection between the two siblings is key. The younger sibling had given up on attending area band but did her music medal and was re-motivated and may now go back. V is encouraging her to do so.

It will be interesting to track the progress as she moves to secondary school but the signs are good that her commitment to out of school activity and her parental support structures appear to be strong. *"If we hit anything, we will sort it"*. The major barrier could be the fact that she will have two buses from home to school and this may affect ongoing engagement.

Case Study 19: Pupil R

The case study of R illustrates the crucial importance of the social elements of In Harmony, while also providing sufficient challenge in terms of repertoire to maintain the interest of young people. IH also provides a safe place where parents feel confident that their children are engaged in something worthwhile.

R is currently in Year 11. She attends the *In Harmony* string orchestra on Friday evenings. She is a very talented violinist who has found the pressure of school challenging. Her attendance at *In Harmony* has been slightly more sporadic recently. She has an older brother with SEN who attends the wind band as a percussionist. R started *In Harmony* in Year 2 and ended tuition in school in Year 4. She continued to engage with activities after school.

R's In Harmony Journey

R began playing the violin in Year 2. She is now aged 16 and in Year 11 at school. At her primary school the children were asked who wanted to learn to play the violin. All of them put up their hands. The teacher selected a small group and she was one of those chosen. She has also tried playing the trumpet but found it too hard on her mouth. She also has a keyboard at home which she uses to play her own songs.

Her family originates from Peru. She has an older brother who is autistic and who began to play percussion when he started secondary school. He also participates in *In Harmony* activities. Her parents do not play instruments, but her grandfather plays the pan pipes, although this has not been an influence on her.

She is now doing GCSEs and only attends *In Harmony* on Fridays. She has previously been more involved and also attended the Sistema orchestra on Saturdays until it ceased functioning. She was sad about that, but it had taken up all of Saturday. This now meant that she had the day for herself.

The single greatest challenge that she has faced and which continues to be something of an issue is reading notation. She had to pick this up herself as she did not have a teacher at school and only learnt through the after-school orchestra activities of *In Harmony* where the fingerings were written under the notes. She has had to teach herself to read music because as the pieces became more difficult it became harder. When she attended summer courses, although she enjoyed them, she felt that she was often the centre of attention because of her difficulties in reading music.

The main benefit she has seen from attending *In Harmony* is that she made many new friends and contacts. At school she is one of only two violinists in her year group, and other young people learning the violin are beginners and not at her standard of playing. She believes that she is more outgoing through her involvement in *In Harmony*, although she gets very nervous playing in concerts and believes that she is not good at performing alone.

She has found that she can master things quickly when necessary. She suddenly found out that she needed to learn two pieces for her GCSE examination, not one. She learned the new piece over three days through intensive practice, although normally she does not spend much time practising. She is currently about at about Grade 4 standard, although she has not taken any examinations.

Her mother sees the key benefit of *In Harmony* as providing a safe space for both of her children. She knows that when they are attending IH they are not hanging around outside with the potential for getting into trouble. The mother enjoys music, attends the concerts and is encouraging. She listens to music but does not play an instrument.

Into the Future

R does not think that she will continue with *In Harmony* when she transfers to her Year 12 provision. This is partly because most of her friends have left so the social elements are less satisfying. Also, in the string orchestra a lot of younger people have joined and the standard is not so high. This means that the music is easier, less challenging and she has played some of it before. She feels that she is not learning anything new and so is not making any improvement. Her mother wants her to continue and there will clearly be ongoing discussions about this. For her 'A' levels she is intending to take psychology, sociology and health and social care. She is hoping to become a counselling psychologist. Her mother supports her in this.

Case Study 11: Pupil B

This case study of B illustrates how parental encouragement can be crucial in maintaining engagement when interest wanes. Even young people who have considerable potential and enjoy music and performing can have times when they do not want to participate. For parents it is important to get the balance right between encouragement and domination. In the long term the latter can be counter-productive. Motivation needs to be intrinsic.

B is in Year 7 and plays the violin. He took part in out of school activities throughout primary school and is now a member of Junior Strings. He has some minor behavioural difficulties but responds well to positive feedback.

B's In Harmony Journey

B has been involved in *In Harmony* for about 6 or 7 years. He is now at secondary school and attending Junior strings. *'I wanted to carry on learning an instrument and continue to develop my skills. There are always new things to learn, new things to play, and new things to learn about the instrument. It was quite easy to carry on, it's the routine of it. Some of the music is quite challenging.'* *In Harmony* had enabled him *'to maintain contact with old friends, keep his instrument, play an instrument. It has meant a lot, connection with his old school, and the ability to play an instrument which is amazing.'*

He does have *'other stuff to do but music is more fun than homework.'* There have been times when he did not want to go to Junior Strings and on one occasion he did not go. He was feeling terrible so *'I just thought, no I'm not going to go.'* Once he was so tired that he thought *'I can't do this'* but he made himself go. Afterwards he felt very proud of himself. He was still very tired, but he thought it was a good decision. His mother referred to the same incident demonstrating her support while also allowing B to make his own decisions. *'B had a little wobble recently. He didn't want to come to the last session and he got really upset. He was really upset about the day that he'd had. I kept saying I really want you to continue because you're good at it. He said that he knew that and that he would go because of me. I told him that I didn't want that but that he should go because he wanted to. I reminded him of how his brother had regretted giving up and said that I didn't want him to regret it and that he should carry on with the music in some shape or form as he got so much enjoyment out of it and he likes to perform and to sing.'*

B expected Junior Strings to be like the Nucleo and it is *'but bigger and stricter. It's not as much fun, it's more serious. I like it to be fun playing, more songs and things.'* His mother reinforced this. *'He enjoyed the games at the hub, the laidback approach. Here he has to think more and do more himself, which he is capable of, but sometimes I think he can't be bothered. I think JS gives him opportunities to progress on his violin, but I still think it should*

be fun. I think JS has managed to capture the happy medium. He enjoys performing, the more prestigious the better.

B's mother says that *In Harmony* gives him *'enjoyment and a release. He has artistic talent and he does enjoy performing. It has given him confidence to perform as well. He will definitely continue with music, but it might not be the violin. He is very musical. He likes drama as well, so it may be a combination of both. He was in Bugsy Malone at school and the teacher gave him the microphone because he could sing in tune and the others couldn't. B had to carry the others. He was very proud.'* When he played to the 90-year-old lady next door. *'She cried. He enjoys people reacting to his playing.'*

His mother felt that the *In Harmony* teachers and the way that they taught were crucial to his ongoing engagement. *'The people who teach them are very approachable, not like teachers, not like friends, they are like approachable mentors. That's really important. B could come to any one of his music teachers and tell them other things that were upsetting him and I think that's what is needed. Such good relationships. I think that's really, really important at this age when they're going through such a lot of changes anyway.'* The relationships with the other young people were also important. *'The fact that they have this little group, this community, all like-minded, come together for music and there's no barriers between them. There isn't the clever ones and the not so clever ones. They are all on a level playing field with the music and that is really important as well.'*

B has some behavioural difficulties. *'B struggles with doing nothing. That's his big thing. The world doesn't move fast enough for him, just sitting there. One of those massive big concerts we went to before at the Town Hall, just sitting there doing nothing was one of the biggest things for him. They've had to learn patience. That's hard to teach. The music gives them an activity. In this day and age it gives them something positive to do. It gives them a channel for their extra energy. Something to focus on. A way to express themselves.'*

There are issues at B's secondary school as he is the only person who plays the violin. There are also some advantages. *'He did a solo at the concert in front of everybody. He played a Christmas carol. He was very, very nervous. I was very proud of him.'* His mother thinks that *In Harmony* helps the children to work together. *'I think the children in the musical community are more respectful of each other. At school, friends are not always helpful. Our daughter gave up because of peer pressure and she regrets it now. She wakes up singing every morning. B is more confident in his own being. He had an extra two years longer than his sister learning before he transferred to secondary school. He was even more involved before he left. The programme empowered B to have confidence to be himself.'*

B'S teacher says that he has developed musically and socially through participating in *In Harmony*. In Year 6 his behaviour and general engagement did drop but he stayed on through transition to secondary school and he is a founding member of the Junior Strings. His teacher commented on a change in his learning. *'There has been a very clear improvement in his resilience as a player. Historically he would give up, put his violin down, even leave the room(!) when met with a new musical challenge. Now I'm delighted to observe his ability to persevere under a challenge. When he is presented with a new piece of repertoire or a challenging run he'll spend time working out the notes or the technique necessary and rarely gives up! I was very encouraged to spot him helping out his desk partner at Junior Strings this week, pointing out the correct fingering for a passage and demonstrating to her how it should be played. Orchestra is now a comfortable place for him to be, a musical home and it's wonderful to see how he has grown technically and holistically.'* His mother also referred to the increase in his musical skills. *'They've got to listen, learn the cues to play, to recognise. We watched Eurovision and he was able to comment on whether they were in tune or not. He's taught himself to play the keyboard for me so that he can play tunes I like – the Titanic theme. If it wasn't for *In Harmony* he wouldn't have been able to do that.'*

His mother welcomed the opportunities offered, particularly the transport to get to Junior Strings, although *'Sometimes it is an effort to race home, get changed, race out again, grab an apple en route so it's a bit of a rushed job. I think that's off putting for him. It was much easier when it was straight from school to the hub but once here he enjoys it.'*

Into the future

In Year 10 he thinks he will continue to play the violin as a hobby, although school work might stop him going to Junior Strings. He does not want to become a professional musician, although he might like to be a singer, singer song writer, or do arrangements. He plays the piano and guitar and can also play the drums. He has thought about working on YouTube making or playing games.

Case Study 10: Pupil C

The case study of C illustrates how participating in In Harmony opened up the opportunity for her to go to a specialist performing arts school. It also demonstrates how the continuity of musical activities supported difficulties in transition and coping with bullying and developed a range of other musical, personal and social skills.

C is in Year 7 and plays the violin. She took part in out of school activities throughout primary school and is now a member of Junior Strings. She also attends Young Musicians (Centre for Advanced Training) weekly. She learns the trumpet at secondary school as violin is not offered. C is a transgender child.

C's In Harmony Journey

C started learning the violin in Year 2. She is now in Year 7. She attends the CAT on Sundays and the Junior String Ensemble on Mondays. On Sundays she has an individual lesson, ensemble, theory and also participates in Dalcroze. This helps her with stretches, positions and posture. The Junior Strings supports the development of her orchestral playing as there is only a small ensemble at CAT.

She views Junior Strings as easy, *'everyone can do it. Some are better than others but that helps us all to progress. It's nice cos we don't have to do things alone we can do it together.'* She particularly likes going to sectionals as *'in orchestra it's hard as it echoes a bit. When we practice our own bits it gets better.'*

At school (a performing arts school) she has lessons on the trumpet. This helps with her breathing and timing as well. Her mother indicated that learning the trumpet came easily because she could already read music. Her place at the school was based on her already playing the violin, an outcome of her involvement in *In Harmony*. The music *'gives her confidence to do all of the other things'* which are part of performing arts (drama, dance). Some things she did in Year 7 music she had already done in Year 2 and she was already confident in performing in front of everyone else. *This is not really a big thing any more as she has been doing it for ages.'*

It is further to travel to Junior strings than to the *In Harmony* Nucleo but she says it's *'better because it is open to more people. It's not like just the small community. It's not just the music, it helps socially as well, doing it with people of different ages.'* She reports benefits to her confidence and socially, although *'doing it on your own can be a bit anxious, makes me a bit nervous.'* Her mother commented *'C likes Junior Strings because it is more challenging.'*

She goes to YYM anyway so she's used to the regimented system. She also knows what it's like to be in a proper orchestra, how to behave and that sort of thing. It prepares them for the future. After the concert I couldn't believe how much they'd improved.'

Her mother also commented on the benefits to her independence. *'So getting herself there on time, I think it's really good. She'll get off the bus and then wait to be picked up and I think it's giving them that bit of independence as well.'* There were also benefits in terms of personal development. *'She has gone from being quite quiet to being able to express herself and that has helped with a lot of things. When she came out as transgender she felt more comfortable coming to the hub. That was something she wasn't scared of. Everybody is approachable and there are people to talk to.'*

Musically, she has found keeping in time challenging and reports that *In Harmony* has helped with this. *'It helps with timing and other lessons, like when I've doing dance. At primary school it was really hard to keep in time.'*

C was aware that *In Harmony* had been a great opportunity for her. *'Some people don't have the opportunity. It makes me feel proud that I can actually do this and I'm good at it.'* She attended the Camp last Summer and really enjoyed it. *'I got to meet other people and it wasn't just strings. It was great fun. I'm doing it this summer as well.'*

Her mother has been very supportive but *'she doesn't know much about music but she says, well, I know that you are really good at it because you played with confidence when you were very young. She helps me a lot.'* Her family always go to concerts and support her and her mother goes to camp and *'feeds the kids'* while watching the progress that they make. Her mother also sees benefits in terms of keeping her daughter safe. *'After school her friends are just hanging around at ASDA. She doesn't do that. She loves her music. She gets up early on Sunday. She does dance and drama at school as well and they expect them to have extra-curricula activities as well. The music has given her confidence.'*

She has received encouragement from her *In Harmony* teachers to carry on as *'they say I'm really talented. They say it will also help in the future giving me experience which will help in getting a job. The teachers will help with anything.'* The teachers themselves commented positively on C's progress. *'It's been a pleasure to see C develop over her time with In Harmony. She has grown in confidence and technical ability and thanks to her enthusiasm has benefitted from other musical opportunities connected to IH.'*

They are also aware of the challenges that she has faced. *'I know the transition to secondary school has at times been a struggle for C. She has talked to us about bullying problems, and general year seven trickiness. I think that the continuity of the musical communities she is involved in has helped ease this transition.'*

Into the Future

C may carry on with music as an option. She really likes performing but is *'interested in science, history. It would be nice to do more than one job. My music teacher teaches music, RE, IT and other things round the school. You don't have to do just one thing.'*

Musically, she would like to expand her range of instruments as she likes the sound of other instruments, for instance, saxophone, clarinet.

Case Study 13: Pupil K

This case study illustrates the important role that is played by a Family Support Worker in enabling and supporting ongoing participation in In Harmony for a young man and his family encountering significant challenges.

K is one of three siblings – he has a younger brother in reception and an elder sister of 14 – and he has been playing trumpet since year 4. There have been some major family problems over the last year or so that have affected K’s ability to fully take part in activity as well as affecting his well being. He will progress to secondary school in September 2018 and will be attending the same school as his elder sister who had learned to play in primary school but dropped it upon progression. This is why the school are providing specific support to K to try to keep him engaged.

K is part of the pilot project being tested by *In Harmony* to assist young people who the team feel need additional support to transition to secondary school. This entails the support of a Family Support Worker, fun sessions with parents and support to attend the Youth Orchestra.

K’s In Harmony Journey

K is a very clever young man who comes across as caring and articulate. He has played for three years and loves it. He saw his sister playing the trumpet and chose that instrument as a result. He started attending Area Band but then stopped. He attended Band Camp and loved that – it was his first time away from home but he met new people from other schools and says *In Harmony* needs more things like that to make it fun! He likes Youth Orchestra as he has made new friends there. He enjoys it more and likes all the teachers.

He has a strong sense of his own worth: *“I think I am the best one in the group.”* However, he has worked hard to get here: *“I found it hard at some points but eventually I get things. I could never play Summertime but then Tom encouraged me and I could do it. If I hear something I like, I want to learn to play it. I would like to learn to play piano at some stage.”*

He is taken to orchestra in a taxi and walks home with a friend after it has finished. This peer group is important to him as the others are a little older and he looks up to them.

K’s mother is a strong woman who supports her children as best she can – she is grounded and pragmatic and works hard to maintain her family. She is proud of K – *“I was so proud when I saw him play – I didn’t realise he was that good. I cried.”* She is also very clear about her aspirations for him: *“K misses his Dad, but I set standards. I want him to grow up to be a good man, to respect women to take responsibility and to be one of the best ones. I want him to do well in school and have a good job and future.”* She had played piano as a young girl in Lithuania but gave up when she moved to secondary school and wants it to be different for K.

Her support is passive: *“I let him choose and don’t pressurize him. If he wants to do something he will and if he doesn’t he won’t. I want him to grow up able to make his own decisions”*

His Mum is happy for him to do whatever he wants, but will he want to carry on himself? She feels that his ‘mind’ might stop him carrying on by which she meant that he can be negative and down on himself at times. He can be changeable and indecisive – *“one day he wants to do it, the next he doesn’t.”* This was borne out by K himself: *“I work hard when I am interested in something but it depends on how I feel. If I am ready to do something or not. I change my mind a lot.”*

The support of the Family Support Worker is crucial to K’s ongoing involvement. Mum, by her own admission, had not had a good relationship with the school until recently but this has changed and she now feels that the school is ‘like home’ – *“I can come in and talk and I get support not just him. They understand our situation.”*

The support of the music tutors has also been of great importance: *“Sometimes they need a role model and I think we can play that role as music teachers – he talks to me a lot and I hope that helps him.”*

Into the Future

K is looking forward to secondary school but is aware it will bring challenges. *“I feel a bit nervous. I will miss this school and the teachers. I will come back for whole school orchestra if I can after school as I like that. I am looking forward to ICT, Sports and Science. I know it will be hard to keep going with my music. Sometimes I want to do it and sometimes I don’t feel like it.”*

Moving forward, it is clear that K’s ongoing engagement with music will be dependent on several key factors. He will need financial as well as logistical support; *“The fact that the lessons are free makes it possible. I couldn’t afford them for him if not. Once we have to pay for travel too that could be a barrier for me. If he has the chance he will continue but it would have to be close as I don’t drive. It is easy at the moment as it is in school but once it is out of school and he has to travel he will have to do it on his own as I work.”*

K has a good peer network of older young boys who have continued to play and that is providing him with role models and support. But, his mother also feels that his network of friends could be the reasons he stops, not because of peer pressure as such, but because of other interests. However, K himself has an interesting take on this and clearly has aspirations for his own future: *“When you want to buy something you have to think, do I really want or need it? Is it worth it? Music is like that. I think I would like to be an entertainer of some sort when I older – maybe a YouTuber – but I also like making my own stuff and building things so you never know.”*

3.3. **Informal music making**

The following two case studies illustrate how *In Harmony* can, in different ways, affect a young person’s engagement with different genres of music making and engaging in informal ways.

Case Study 8: Pupil A

The case study of A shows how a young person can be supported by IH as he learns to adjust to living in a new country where he does not speak the language. It also demonstrates how engagement with IH can provide the basis for learning music in a different genre.

In the secondary school, the students learn to play an instrument in Years 7 and 8. They have one hour of curriculum music where they use their instruments, one hour of sectionals/instrumental skills and one hour of full orchestra. There are several orchestras as the school is very large and does not have sufficient accommodation for them all to play together. In Year 9 they can continue with *In Harmony*, opt for a more popular music option, or do dance or drama. There is a practice club before school on Thursday and a new after school orchestra also on Thursday. J is in Year 8 and plays the trombone.

A’s *In Harmony* Journey

A began IH when he moved to the UK a year before the interview. He started secondary school in Year 7 at beginning of the Summer term. He did not speak any English. *'It was quite hard to understand what the people around told me to be able to respond but I got used to it in time and I tried harder and harder to learn English. I am now at the level where I can communicate with people. Sometimes, when it is very loud around me or people speak very fast it is hard. I am still struggling with understanding, I am still getting used to that. At home we only speak Rumanian. My father is learning English and we are helping him.'*

As he started in the Summer term he had to catch up on everything they had learned in music. *'The exams at the end of the year, that was hard but my classmates gave me their books and they helped me out and I managed to do it.'*

He took to the trombone immediately. *'I really like the sound of the trombone, a very strong sound, the way that my teacher played was very nice and clear. I was able to get a sound out of it straight away but it was a weird sound.'* He can now play about ten to 12 notes and some accidentals. He does not attend the before school practice or the after school orchestra. Lessons take place in a group of about 10 or 12, brass and woodwind together. He does not take his trombone home to practice.

Next year he is going to give up *In Harmony* as he wants to play the guitar. He will take the popular music option. He has his own acoustic guitar and listens to tutorials on the internet, on YouTube. He has a music book, and papers with the notes. *'That's how I pretty much learn. The hardest thing, on YouTube they tell you the name of the note, not what finger you need to use. I had to learn all the names and all the positions. After that it became quite easy. Nothing is easy, but maybe the strumming is the easiest. Sometimes when you are strumming you have to miss some things and that is hard and complicated.'* He can do most of the chords in most keys and when he has been learning longer may take exams on the guitar.

He has friend who played the guitar who persuaded him to take it up. He says that he plays simple beginner songs at the moment as he is still getting used to it. He has learned a lot of notes but finds it difficult switching from one to another. He is mainly playing chords not tunes. When asked if he sang as he played he said *'I don't like my voice, through puberty it cracks a lot,'* although he hopes to sing with the guitar at some point. *'I really like playing the guitar and it is my ambition to do that in my spare time. I might be in a rock group but I just like doing it.'* Sometimes he plays with his friend, but more usually on his own. He practises a lot, although in the week before the interview he had not practised much because he had exams to revise for but usually he does about half an hour a day.

He likes the guitar more than the trombone. *'I like that you can play different songs on the guitar, there are not many instruments that can play multiple notes at the same time. It makes a really nice sound and I really like it, more than the trombone. I do trombone at school, and guitar at home.'*

His older brother represented the family in the interviews and indicated that since participating in *In Harmony* A had become more interested in music. *'He asked us to get him a guitar which we did and he's more involved in music. Our grandfather used to play the mouth organ but Alex was too young to have really been influenced by him. He was only four when he died. We all listen to music at home, traditional music, pop, R&B, different things. My young sister is learning at this school but is not really interested in music.'* His brother explained that A attended a guitar class every Wednesday after school and was *'more interested in the guitar than the trombone. He has a childhood friend who plays he guitar and now they play together sometimes. That is why he asked us to get him a guitar. He is just doing it because he likes it and is enjoying it a lot.'* The family would support him in anything he would want to be involved in. *'We would love him to choose such a career in music but that is up to him. We can also guide him in what he wants to do.'*

A was very excited about the *In Harmony* programme and the concert. *'He told us about the concert at least five times a day. We went to the concert. It meant a lot for us to be there.'* A's teacher was very complementary about him as a learner. *'I only started teaching him in Year 8. He's very knowledgeable about music, crotchets, quavers, keys. He's got that musical understanding. It is rare that he has that much knowledge. He's like a sponge, everything goes in. English not being his first language presents some difficulties. He's really trying as hard as he can. He's not the most able trombonist in In Harmony project but that doesn't matter that much. He's had a massive learning curve. He's really knuckled down and applies himself to anything. The project has allowed him the opportunity to do this.'*

Into the future

A wants to be a maths teacher. He expects to carry on playing on the guitar as a hobby. It was his involvement in IH which increased his interest in music leading him to find an instrument that he believed suited him better and which he liked more.

Case Study 7: Pupil J

This case study provides an example of the way that In Harmony in a secondary school can enhance musical learning for students who have strong non-musical career aspirations and provide them with skills for music becoming a hobby. The students learn to play an instrument in Years 7 and 8. They have one hour of curriculum music where they use their instruments, one hour of sectionals/instrumental skills and one hour of full orchestra. There are several orchestras as the school is very large and does not have sufficient accommodation for them all to play together. In Year 9 they can continue with In Harmony, opt for a more popular music option, or do dance or drama. There is a practice club before school on Thursday and a new after school orchestra also on Thursday.

J is in Year 8 and plays the violin. He is described as a 'middle attainer' by the school. His passion is football and he would like to be a professional footballer. He is one of a family of 4, three boys and one girl. Music may be a hobby for him later on.

J's In Harmony Journey

J played the recorder in primary school in Years 3 and 4 and sang in assemblies. When he moved to secondary school he decided to play the violin because it was the smallest instrument. *'I didn't want to play the double bass so it was between violin and viola.'* If he had been in the other class and able to do wind instruments he thinks he would *'have found it annoying to have to put the instrument together.'* His mother believed that he chose the violin because it was the most difficult. Overall, he has a pragmatic approach *'I just get told what to play and I do it.'* His teacher supports this *'He's a very able child. In terms of curriculum, he's very able. He just takes a challenge, is focused and gets on with it.'*

He has been learning for almost two years. He can play all of the open strings, and all three fingers on some strings. They haven't learnt about the fourth finger yet. He thinks he can play about 15 tunes.

He does not practice at home. He took his violin home for a couple of weeks but then it started to hurt his shoulder, so he stopped taking it. He doesn't attend the before school practice or the after school one because he has football practice. He only does music in school time. The activity he likes best is playing in the string orchestra but *'it is a bigger challenge because more people are messing up, making mistakes.'* The hardest thing is *'doing the fingers. When you change from one finger to another that's hard and it's hard matching the fingers with the musical notes.'*

He will continue with *In Harmony* in Year 9. He is not sure if he will continue in Year 10. *'If I get selected for football and we get training I'll probably miss about two days of school. I'll have to do the extra work at home. If I get selected for a team then I get days off school for the matches.'*

His granddad plays the guitar, flute and drums and has a lot of different instruments. He likes him playing the violin. *'He wanted me to sing when I was younger.'* He has two brothers and a sister. The sister plays the recorder at primary school, but the others don't play. He says that his Mum sings. *'There is a lot of music at home, in the car. It is very loud. If my mates are in the car she likes to sing which is embarrassing.'*

Into the future

J wants to be a footballer but if he can't make it as a footballer he wants to be a forensic scientist. He has looked into the examination grades he needs to get to do science including chemistry and biology. He loves football, music is not as important. Music might be a hobby in the future although he might change instrument.

3.4. The Challenges

In Harmony serves communities experiencing economic deprivation. Deprivation is defined not only in terms of material deprivation but also in the social exclusion from the ordinary patterns, customs and activities of society, i.e. cultural deprivation. This means that young people face serious challenges so while the programmes provide the basis for progression in terms of engendering a love of music and strong musical identities, these are often not sufficient to ensure progression.

Case Study 9: Pupil C

The case study of C illustrates the role of In Harmony in supporting musical development in a low attaining child who has difficulties with retention and concentration and who is also in receipt of the Pupil Premium.

In the secondary school, the students learn to play an instrument in Years 7 and 8. They have one hour of curriculum music where they use their instruments, one hour of sectionals/instrumental skills and one hour of full orchestra. There are several orchestras as the school is very large and does not have sufficient accommodation for them all to play together. In Year 9 they can continue with *In Harmony*, opt for a more popular music option, or do dance or drama. There is a practice club before school on Thursday and a new after school orchestra also on Thursday. C is in Year 7 and plays the trumpet.

C's In Harmony Journey

C said that she started playing the trumpet in Year 5 (presumably through the whole class ensemble programme). *'I still wanted to carry on. In year 5 I played the trumpet for the whole year, then in Year 6 I played the trombone and I didn't like it.'* When she started at secondary school she switched back to trumpet. *'I like holding it, the trombone was dead hard.'* Her father is also teaching her the piano at home. He plays a lot of instruments. When she has to walk home she can't be bothered to carry the trumpet home as it is very heavy. If she needs to take it home, she gets her father to collect her. She practices at school in the practice club in the morning and sometimes goes to the after-school orchestra.

She has collected all her badges for music. In the before school club they practice their instruments and do some singing. She also does dance, drums and ballet out of school. She likes the drums the best and has been playing them for 3 months. She thinks she is better at the drums than the trumpet.

She is not sure if she wants to continue playing the trumpet. The hardest thing about it is holding it and doing the fingering. The difficulty is remembering which fingers go with which notes. When she is in Year 9 she thinks she will do the drums not the trumpet. She can also play the guitar. Her father lets her use his. She is getting a drum kit for her birthday and then she will practice the drums a lot.

Her teacher says that C *'struggles in terms of ability. She is focused and wants to do well, she wants to achieve. She enjoys the social aspect. It is the orchestra and social element that she enjoys most.'* She described how C was *'low on confidence and low ability struggling across the school. We did a demonstration as soon as we started In Harmony and she decided she wanted to learn the trumpet, so we gave her a trumpet. She took to it like a duck to water. She picked it up straight away. But there are still some things like retention of information that can be a bit of a struggle. It's been a slow process.'*

Her father plays a lot of different instruments, keyboard, organ, guitar and used to be in a band and do gigs around the country. He does not do this anymore. Her mother and one brother also play instruments. Overall, they are quite a musical family. At home there is a lot of music in a very wide range of genres.

Her parents say that C had only brought the trumpet home a few times. They said that *'she gives up pretty easily when she can't do it. She gets distracted by her brother and sister and loses concentration quickly. She listens to music and tries to sing but she can't sing in tune.'* Her father says that *'she isn't musically talented at the moment, although with some practice she might be able to do all kinds of things but at the moment she isn't practising.'* Her brother and sister *'take the mick at home.'* C likes dancing and gymnastics. She watches YouTube and then practices gymnastics in the house or the garden. She goes to gymnastics after school. Her parents think she might be more suited to gymnastics than music.

Into the future

C's parents indicated that C changed her career aspirations all the time. It was difficult to predict what option she would take in Year 9. She is certainly enthusiastic about gymnastics. She even demonstrated how she could do the splits before leaving the room at the end of the interview

Case Study 5: Pupil C

The case study of C illustrates the challenges which can arise when young people transfer to secondary school after leaving an In Harmony primary school in terms of limited opportunities and dealing with bullying. It also illustrates how In Harmony can inspire young people to want to pursue a career in music and can offer support to the young person and the family.

C is now in Year 10 and is 14 years old. She has a sister who is 10. She is keen to pursue a career in music. She plays the trumpet with *In Harmony* and drum kit with Rock School at her secondary school. She has been part of the Sistema Young Leaders programme and is a young leader in the after school Nucleo Orchestra as well as lead trumpet in the *In Harmony* Youth Ensemble. She also goes to *In Harmony* England every year where she plays in the orchestra.

C's In Harmony Journey

C started playing the trumpet in Year 4 when she was 8. She had learnt the basics of the French horn and trombone first. When she chose which instrument she wanted to play she chose the trumpet as she hadn't done that before. Her mother said *'it is all about music for her since she had that trumpet in Year 4 and she's reading music. She was just hooked to it right from the start. She was a natural to it.'*

On Tuesday she has band practice, plays the drums and has her trumpet lesson. This is free of charge. *'We don't have to pay for it as it's an after school club.'* She has an individual trumpet lesson for an hour. This focuses on examination work and sometimes on orchestral pieces. She does keyboard in class at school. She is currently working on her Grade 3 which she will take in the Summer term. This will be her first music exam. Her trumpet teacher said that the aural requirements initially terrified her but that she is working on them and generally her confidence is improving. Her teacher said that she was *'also better able to learn pieces between lessons and is starting to become a more resilient learner and take a bit more responsibility for her own learning which is quite a departure from the style of teaching and learning that she has been used to.'*

C also acknowledged her trumpet teacher's analysis that she had *'improved massively since September'* She reported having learned to sightread and has worked with the younger children teaching them different pieces. Her teacher has told her that she will *'go very far as a musician.'*

She has a role as a mentor. *'I've been given the opportunity to work with one student from my section, to teach, play with him, like get to know him quite well. We already had a connection and we got given the purple book to like guide us and write down things. It was really good and we've finished it now.'*

She will be doing GCSE Music next year and will perform on trumpet and drums. She will have to do two or three performances recording her playing and playing in front of the teachers as proof that she has done the work. Her previous music teacher at the secondary school left. He was very supportive. *'He knew all about my music. He used to come into the practice room and check my scales and play these pieces for me, sight read that and be really supportive and encourage me to be like a musician. But he left to go to Spain.'*

She acknowledges that there will be challenges when she gets to her GCSEs in Year 11. *'I will work really hard but I'll still be able to find the time for music.'* Although in Year 10 there are examination pressures, she indicates that it is all about finding the time. *'It's all about timing and how much you care about it like, find the time, just carry on with it.'* She practices almost everyday if she can, about an hour each day.

At the secondary school she goes to they cut music in the performing arts GCSE in September. As an alternative the school offered GCSE music once a fortnight for two hours after school. This clashed with the nucleo at *In Harmony* on Thursday. She was upset about this so transport was arranged so that she would not miss as much. She can attend one week normally one week a bit less. *'Music has been cancelled for me and we have to do it on Thursday after school for two hours every other week. This takes an hour and a half out of Nucleo for me every other week but it's worth it when I'll get a GCSE at the end of year 11. I am still doing music theory lessons and a teacher comes from another school to do practical work with us. There are six of us. Many dropped it because it was after school. It is a mixture of In Harmony people and others.'*

At the moment she does not have her own trumpet. *'I have got one on loan but I will have to give it back when I finish Year 11. I am saving up now. Trumpets are like between £200 to*

£500 so my parents will chip in a little. My parents are very supportive.’ She has had an upgrade on her trumpet and her parents have been looking at trumpets but the family need advice from In Harmony staff about what type she needs.

Her neighbours are supportive and don’t mind her practising at home. Her mother explained that *‘she will go and play happy birthday etc., so the neighbours are OK.’* There is no music in her background, although her aunts and uncles are supportive and come to the concerts. Their children go to the same schools. Her cousin plays the violin, and another aunt has children who are into music. The son sings, and the daughter does drumming and singing. There is a family link, they are a musical family. This is on both sides of the family. Her mother described how at home she will ask to be given a song to learn. *‘I wanted her to do the last post. She learnt it in a week and half and I was so proud of her. It sounded amazing. She worked so hard to play it. If I ask her to learn a tune she just goes away and learns it. She writes down music for what she’s got to learn to play. I don’t have to encourage, she loves doing it. She loves the drums as well. She joined the rock band which is on a Wednesday and got to like the drums.’*

Her mother indicates that she is good academically at school. *‘She wants to learn. Some take the mickey out of her because she does so well. They tease her. They are jealous. I have been down to the school and I voiced my opinion about this. She has got better as time has gone on dealing with it. I say to her it is all about jealousy. Don’t let it affect your career and not what you want to do in life and that’s what she says to herself and to them. “where are you going to be at the end of Year 11? I’m going to be successful.” Sometimes she has come home and cried and cried. I don’t like that. We try and talk to her about what the other children might be going through, we don’t know. They just want to knock you down to where they are.’*

C reports that music has helped with her English because *‘she thinks of a piece of music and writes a story about that.’*

Into the Future

C wants to go to a conservatoire to study music. Before that she will attend a local college. The *In Harmony* staff will advise about this. After university she wants to be in an orchestra. Her mother said *‘her dreams all come from this. She does want a profession out of it, definitely. I can’t thank In Harmony enough for what they’ve done. They’ve given her a future really. If they hadn’t given her this trumpet in Year 4 I don’t know what she would have done. The music has given her that goal.’*

C is aware that she will need qualifications to be accepted into a good college, five good GCSEs. There may be some issues locally about provision for ‘A’ level music. *‘We had college open evening and I asked everyone about doing ‘A’ level music and no-one did ‘A’ level music. They did drama and dance but not music.’*

C has concerns about getting to Grade 8 by the end of year 11. That is only a year. *‘I think I’ll be OK in my exam but I’m not sure about getting to Grade 8 in a Year. When I went to Sistema England I was told that if I tried hard I could be a Grade 7. I was playing Grade 7 music and at the time I wasn’t practising that much but now I go to three to four clubs per week and practice whenever I can.’*

C’s teacher explained that they had *‘had conversations about the steps she will need to take to get her where she needs to be. She is aware that there is a long journey ahead of her and that she will need to increase her personal practice routine in order to meet the requirements.’*

Case Study 6: Pupil S

This case study illustrates how In Harmony supported a young person whose mother died and who then had to go and live with her father with whom she had previously had limited contact. The family situation was further complicated as she also has a brother with very severe autism. In Harmony provided stability and activities after school which gave opportunities for friendship and self-expression.

S's In Harmony journey

S started on the violin when she was very young. She did not find the violin very interesting and changed to bassoon in Year 5. *'They were showing the different instruments and I just thought that the bassoon sounded really good.'* She is now 11 years old and at secondary school.

She plays on Monday and Thursday after school at *In Harmony* but has not been to any Sistema activities in the school holidays. She may be going this year. At secondary school music is in rotation with drama and they play the keyboard and xylophone. After school she sings in a choir, where they mainly sing pop songs. She also goes to Rock Band. On Tuesday she goes to an Art club. Friday she is free. She also learns things from Youtube on her own.

Her father played the clarinet in Albania as a boy. He no longer plays and says he wasn't taught as the children are now. *'We were taught by Solfa not letter names. Schools were closed for months. There was no government for a time, or police. In Albania in 1995/6 there were lots of problems. There were no opportunities for orchestras'*. He came to England in 1999 when he was 17. The teachers of the *In Harmony* Programme have said that he could join and learn the clarinet again if he wanted to. His son, aged 13, has very severe autism and is in a residential home. His wife died two years ago. He explained that he wasn't expecting to have to look after two children on his own. He has put the children first and works 3 days a week rather than 5.

S was there when her mother died. Her mother was very ill and went from being a person to being a shell. S experienced this first hand. He and his wife had been separated before she became ill. When S's father came to England he didn't speak English, had no friends, and it was a shock to the system. He believes that S went through something similar when she lost her mother. *In Harmony* after school activities helped her. *'She hasn't spoken about it. The music gave her stability, coming in, meeting all the people, a sense of normality. To her it's been great to have something to carry on with after school.'*

S has found learning the bassoon relatively easy. Her teacher reports that *'she is always a better player by the end of the lesson.'* Despite this she does not do much practice at home. This is in part because consistent practice was not established at the beginning as the children were not allowed to take their instruments home. Because of family circumstances she often has to go to her aunt's house after school and when she gets home it's too late to practice. Her teacher says that she coped well with her mother's death. *'She kept playing the bassoon through it, she kept coming to school, she kept enjoying her bassoon lessons. Before she left primary school she was learning with two boys, one of whom was never going to get anywhere and one who found it quite easy but didn't do any practice, could just pick it up and do it and had no intention of continuing at secondary school. She suffers now from being the only bassoon in orchestra. She learns very, very quickly. The more I play with her the more she picks up on tuning. I told her that she should play for 20 minutes every day and she said is that how you get good? She's delightful to teach, picks things up instantly, remembers things. She could be entered for Grade 1 now and would cope well. She has a good ear.'* Her teacher would like her to be able to take a graded examination as it would really motivate her. S is good at a lot of school subjects. Her father says that he hears a lot of good things about her.

He is surprised at this as he was not high achieving.

Into the Future

She thinks she will carry on playing while she is at school but not for ever. She does not have any career aspirations in any direction. Her father says that *'She is undecided about what she wants to do. She is undecided about many things.'* He will support her whatever she wants to do.

The earlier research stated that:

"Engaging parents in areas of high deprivation can be challenging but is very important. In Harmony programmes need to try to engage parents at the earliest opportunity"

Case Study 18: Pupil D

This case study illustrates how transfer to secondary school can create issues for attendance at In Harmony activities, how practising at home can be problematic and how music can become a career option when other avenues are no longer possible.

D is currently in Year 11. He attends the In Harmony after school wind band and the Youth Symphony Orchestra on Thursday and Friday evenings. D started *In Harmony* in Year 2 at a key partner school. He found playing a stringed instrument difficult and decided to switch to trombone. He has continued to attend *In Harmony* after school despite having lots of other commitments. He is currently deciding what to do after Year 11.

D, a very tall, African-Caribbean boy, is now in Year 11 and attending an academy some distance from his home. He is a talented trombone player and has been playing for 6 years. He now also plays percussion, kit drum and timpani. He has two siblings, a sister and brother. The sister used to play the viola, but has now given up playing. His brother started playing the cello but has also given up. His father plays the piano and this is a major hobby. His genre is 'house'. Mother can play the steel pans. The family do not play together as the genres are very different.

D's *In Harmony* journey

D's school was one of the first to introduce percussion, wind and brass instruments and initially they all learnt to play the basics on a range of instruments. He chose the trombone *'because it is bit and long, like him.'* He is 6' 2.5" (the 0.5 is very important to him) He began attending the *In Harmony* out of school activities soon after he started playing but there was a hiatus when he transferred to secondary school. This was because his secondary school day did not finish until 5pm, too late to attend *In Harmony* activities. This meant that he had to return his trombone. After some negotiation, the school allowed him to leave early on *In Harmony* days so that he was able to resume his attendance and take up his instrument again.

His life is full of music. He attends *In Harmony* on Thursdays (orchestra), Friday (windband) and on Saturday and Sunday 'Tomorrow's Warriors' a jazz and big band group. He used to attend the Sistema orchestra on Saturdays until it ceased functioning last year. He is taking music GCSE He has attended several summer schools in Lambeth and elsewhere including the National Orchestra for All and is hoping to be able to be part of the Sistema orchestra performing in Birmingham this year.

His biggest challenge was learning to sight read. *'When I started I couldn't sight read. In orchestra I'd sit at the back and pretend sometimes, or just follow every one else. That's how I learned to play jazz, I played by ear for quite a while before I learned to sight read properly. That was a challenge. The teacher here, who was a jazz trombonist just made me go over and over it. I'd have quizzes in my lessons every week and now I can sight read almost perfectly.'*

He can only practise at school as *'the trombone is loud, I haven't got a mute and the neighbours have complained.'*

As a result of attending *In Harmony* he believes that he has become *'a more confident person, able to speak out'*. He also emphasised the importance of team work. *'Definitely team work and co-operation, everyone's ideas. I just love working with people. If I work by myself I get distracted easily and start messing about but with everyone there, there is always someone to help me snap back into focus or if I don't get something in my music there is someone to help me.'*

His parents have supported him all the way, always attending concerts. His father travelled to Leeds to one concert he was playing in.

Into the future

D had a promising potential career playing basketball, with offers of joining teams in Europe in the summer holidays until a recent knee injury which now makes that extremely unlikely. He was offered places at two schools for his sixth form which specialised in sport but has had to reject these because of his injury. He is now intending to take music at 'A' level along with mathematics and English Literature. He would like to become a music teacher because *'he likes working with children and loves music'*. He was described as a very good mentor to younger children in IH. His current In Harmony teachers believe that this is a realistic aim. He is currently at about Grade 5/6 graded examination level, although he has not taken any examinations yet.

The earlier research also found that there was a need to do more than simply provide opportunities: *"To ensure that young people engaged with In Harmony can progress in the ways that they wish, it is not sufficient to have structured opportunities in place for them. Action has to be taken to remove the barriers which prevent them from taking up those opportunities."*

Case Study 14 provides a stark illustration of this particular challenge.

Case Study 14: Pupil L

*This case study illustrates the problems faced when **opportunities** are available but the child is unable to **choose** to take them because of family circumstances and parental choices that are preventing progression.*

L is now in year 6 of Primary School and has been playing trumpet for three years. She is very clever and has two siblings – aged 23 and 12 - and would love to continue to play upon progressing to secondary school. She is currently Deputy Head Girl and somewhat eccentric and very endearing.

L is part of the pilot project being tested by *In Harmony* to assist young people who the team feel need additional support to transition to secondary school. This entails the support of a Family Support Worker, fun sessions with parents and support to attend the Youth Orchestra.

L's In Harmony Journey

L began playing in year 4 and is currently working towards her Grade Two exams having passed Grade One last year. She attends youth orchestra on Mondays and has lessons in school time. She doesn't attend Area Bands as she *'couldn't be bothered at the time.'*

She is nervous about her progression to secondary school. Her school was chosen because her Mum does not have a car and the school is close to home. *"I had no choice."* She will be going without her friendship groups who are going to different schools and claims she finds it hard to make new friends: *"I can be shy and introverted when I don't know people but loud when I get to know them!"* She also realizes the time it ends clashes with youth orchestra timings and will be unable to attend without some kind of exemption that allows her to leave school early on Mondays.

She highlights a general issue about progression and differentiation as young people develop skills: *"I get frustrated in large groups as it can sound awful and I hate it when some people play less well than me – they need to try harder in my opinion!"*

The opportunity to play at home is limited because her Mum and Sister don't like the sound, and nor does the dog, so she is limited in how much practice she can do. *"I have to use breaks to practice as I can't practice at home and if I don't practice, I won't get better and I want to."*

On Saturdays she sees her father so that also limits her ability to join the Intermediate group and this is not something that can be changed. It would seem as if adult decisions have constrained the possibilities for L to take the opportunities that are available to her.

Into the Future

L is aware of the pressures of secondary school and not very optimistic about her ability to continue to play once she progresses. She is attending a welcome evening at her new Secondary School and was planning to ask about music provision as she was not aware of what was on offer. She will also ask about the possibility of being able to leave early on Mondays to attend youth orchestra.

L is a talented football player too and is already aware of a clash between music provision and her football club. She has high aspirations for herself and is passionate about animation, design and drawing.

"Here's the thing, I would love to continue but I just can't see how I will be able to ..."

3.5. Practices that support and can contribute to the ongoing involvement and the development of the *In Harmony* programmes

The earlier research highlighted many factors that contributed to the ongoing involvement of young people and highlighted many things which contributed to successful programmes. Drawing on the experiences of the six programmes, both positive and negative, it identified strategies, activities and approaches that may contribute to success in addressing the challenges faced in supporting young people to progress.

The following four case studies highlight some of these things including the involvement of professional musicians as mentors and role models, the importance of family support as well as pastoral support, opportunities for the development of social networks and friendship groups, the development of extra curricular opportunities as early as possible, the importance of sibling involvement as role models and the importance of performances.

Case Study 17: Pupil A

This case study illustrates the importance of the role played by professional musicians as well as the support of parents.

A is in Year 8 and continues to play in *In Harmony*. He has a younger sibling who also plays. He is a quiet self contained young man with a slight stutter but very talented and bright.

A's *In Harmony* Journey

A started playing violin in Year 4. He moved to an *In Harmony* primary school in year 4 due to family circumstances and this meant he started later than his peers. *"I was learning to play guitar in my old school and I didn't know what to expect but I was excited at a new style of music and playing and chose to learn the violin because of the way it sounded. I have no regrets. I love the sound."*

He progressed very rapidly and is now playing at Grade 5 level. *"I worked hard and caught up quite quickly with the others – it is all about hard work and dedication."* He recently played and spoke at the *In Harmony* 8th birthday reception for donors. He is a member of the Youth Orchestra and attends on Tuesdays and Thursdays and this doesn't interfere with his other activities. A is also a keen footballer and clearly very talented across the board.

A joined the pilot Pre-Associate Scheme. His music tutor said:

"A is a pleasure to teach. He came to lessons always knowing what he wanted to work on that lesson. This shows his mature, thoughtful approach to his violin playing. Throughout lessons he listens carefully to any suggestions and is usually able to execute what has been asked of him quite quickly. He has a natural stylistic ability when interpreting music, I noticed this especially in a piece of Handel which he prepared for his grade 5. I am looking forward to seeing how the next 6 lessons take shape without the specific goal of an exam it will be nice to shape the lessons according to his needs."

A has also taken part in LPYAO, the chamber weekend and summer school chamber activity, plus successfully auditioned for Sistema Europe Youth Orchestra, a 10 day intensive musical course which took place in Birmingham at the end of August 2018.

In his secondary school, which is walking distance from home and the Friary where *In Harmony* activity takes place, music is taught on a 'carousel' with art and performance and A does not really enjoy the music being taught. *"It is boring after what I have done in In Harmony so I am not taking music at GCSE."*

When asked about any peer pressure, he was clear that it had been there: *"I am not part of that set. I don't interfere with them and they don't interfere with me."*

"It has given me skills that some people never have the chance to get. I have had great opportunities and it has given me confidence and flair – is that the right word? – I am a better listener and more attentive to other people. I am more sociable and have met people I would not otherwise have met."

His parents are very supportive – *"I couldn't do it without them."*

A talks about the importance of the role the RLP musicians and music teachers play: *"It is so motivating to sit alongside a professional musician. They are so encouraging and supportive and that motivates me to be even better."*

Into the Future

A is part of the Youth Academy Orchestra pilot programme and fully intends to continue playing as he moves forward. He sees potential problems with exams and needing to stop temporarily at that stage to ensure he can do well but it is his intention to take every opportunity he is offered and continue to develop his skills and confidence as well as the standards of his playing.

“I will not throw this opportunity away. It is very special and I appreciate everything In Harmony is giving me.”

The In Harmony Music Director says: *“A has made fantastic progress on the violin, from picking up the violin for the first time to Grade 5 in just over 2 ½ years is outstanding. He is an exceptional role model to the young people around him, and continues to work really hard to grasp every opportunity that comes his way. We are incredibly proud of him and all that he has achieved, and look forward to continuing to support him however we can and nurturing and developing his skills and talents.”*

Case Study 3: Pupil E

The case of E illustrates how important family support is to continued progression and how transitioning to out of school provision prior to secondary school can help to support continuing engagement. E is now in year 7. She has played Clarinet since year 3 and is the eldest of 5 children. Her younger siblings are also learning to play and the youngest sibling is in Reception.

E’s In Harmony Journey

“I have done it now for so long, I will continue to play.”

“At first we did not realise how good she was ...”

E’s music teacher has taught her since she started playing. She recently achieved a high merit at Grade 3 and will be taking her Grade 4 exam in summer 2018. According to her music teacher, she has a *“rooted musicality but needs to be less cautious and introverted as a player.”*

She takes part in Saturday morning activity and studies musicianship as well as having her private lessons. She now also plays recorder - *“she picked it up and fitted in immediately”* - and play in the woodwind ensembles as well as orchestra. It is possible that E could enter the Centre for Advanced Training but it is seen as a big step for her that she may not yet be ready to make.

In addition to this she takes part in the Symphony Orchestra and has attended two Sistema Summer Schools. *“I was really homesick the first time but the second time was fine – it is great to have new experiences and to make new friends from different places.”*

Her Mam recognizes the amazing opportunity this has presented to both E and her family: *“We could not have done this ourselves – we couldn’t have afforded it and I wouldn’t have even known she could be as good at it. It just wouldn’t have happened. So, I am really grateful for it. I always tell her she is lucky and not to throw away the opportunity.”*

But this is not easy to support logistically with 4 younger siblings at home. Mam relies heavily on Grandad who drives E to the Centre for Advanced Training and stays with her often sitting in on lessons relaying messages back home and supporting practice at home. The plus side of the equation is that, according to Mam – *“I have my own orchestra at home!”* -

E's secondary school was chosen because it has a reputation for being good with music as well as being a good school academically. E is now playing keyboard at school and has the option to play something else as well – possibly a Trumpet. So, in addition to her *In Harmony* involvement she is enjoying more exposure through the school. She is eligible to join the 6th form orchestra at school. She is enjoying her new school: *"I had to make new friends – it was hard at first and I was really shy in the first few weeks but I am used to it now."*

E is clear that *In Harmony* has given her a great deal more than a music education: *"My confidence has grown loads – I used to think I wasn't good enough but I now realise that I am and that I can do all sorts of things if I apply myself."*

Into the Future

"I like to be perfect – the best I can be ... "

E is ambitious and says that she would like to be a music tutor when she is older. She is clearly academically very bright and has a quiet determination that is impressive in one so young.

Her Mam sees a few challenges ahead but is confident that they will deal with them together: *"I think that the major challenges will be homework and the pressure of work as she moves through secondary school. It is going to get harder for her to balance everything but we are here to support her and her Grandad is her biggest supporter!"*

Her music tutor is also confident that she will continue playing: *"The school is good so she is not going to be led by others. She is strong and passionate and intelligent. She has support at home and they want more for her than they had and won't let her waste her talent."*

Case Study 4: Pupil K

The case study of K illustrates how In Harmony can support whole families, some of the members of which might have complex problems. At the same time In Harmony can also support aspiring, talented young musicians.

K lives with his mother and three brothers (aged 16, 8 and 4), an elder sister has already left home. Two of the brothers are on the autistic spectrum and have conduct issues. The family is under the guardianship of the local authority and K has previously been in foster care. K is currently in Year 6. He plays the flute and has shown considerable musical talent. He would like to become a professional flautist. He is very enthusiastic and attends all musical opportunities, singing and playing his flute. He has recently been accepted onto this year's cohort of children for National Orchestras for All and has been invited to play with the *In Harmony* Chamber Ensemble.

K's *In Harmony* Journey

K began his musical journey in Year 1 learning the violin but changed to flute when offered the opportunity. He has been learning the flute for 3 years. He also plays the drums. His older brother plays the trumpet and his younger brother plays the violin. They have all learned within the *In Harmony* programme.

When he leaves his primary school at the end of this academic year, he will go to the nearest secondary school. K is clear that he will carry on playing when he gets there. *'I do music whenever I can. I do it on Thursdays and Mondays after school and in school time on Mondays and Thursdays. I like playing the flute because I'm good at it and it's one of those things you can do all of the time, and go to other places.'* He likes the opportunities that *In Harmony* offers for visiting other places and playing in different orchestras with different people.

He chose his instrument because he *'liked the sound of the flute and I really like that I can do it well. We did a test. We had an assembly and people picked which instrument they wanted and some people went to the flutes, oboes and clarinets and I went to the flute and I blew out of it and I blew out of it straight away and I blew perfectly straight away and a lot of people couldn't.'* His mother recalled his transition to the flute and his progress since then. *'He took to it like a duck to water, straight away. He can look at a piece, play it a few times and then just memorise it.'*

He has generally found it easy to play *'At first just to learn the fingerings of A to C was pretty easy. It got a little bit harder and then easier again and then I started playing proper music. It is definitely easy now. I can read notes just like that.'*

He practises at home which sometimes involves making up his own pieces. *'I practice old pieces that I've played, and then sometimes I wrote my own piece because I was bored at the time and played it. It didn't sound the best, though.'* He has also sufficient musical skills to work independently. *'I play things I already know and I go online and find other pieces that I like and I play them. I really wanted to play the Simpsons theme tune and Harry Potter and I found them online. I learnt by ear, every note I paused it and tried to find the note on the flute and then I wrote it down.'*

His teacher acknowledged his musicianship. *'I knew that K stood out among his peers through his sense of musicianship. K is naturally able to grasp musical concepts and flute technique very quickly and therefore his progress has been remarkable! Each time I've given him a challenging piece of music, he has come back with it mostly learned despite the pieces becoming increasingly challenging.'*

His immediate family are very supportive. His mother used to play the trumpet at secondary school, although she indicated that she could remember little about it. At the time she was living with her grandmother, the musical activities went on late and it was a struggle to get home so she had to give up playing.

She attends all of the concerts and is very proud when he plays solos. *'I can't believe how good he is, it's just excellent.'* She reported that *'The tickets for the concerts and travelling can be expensive although the In Harmony activities are reasonably priced.'* His Mum recognised the importance of attending concerts. *'It was worth it to see the children playing. It improves their music because they know we are going to be there.'*

The other members of the family all play instruments, the younger ones the violin the older boy the trumpet. He has behavioural difficulties and ADHD and the school have agreed that when he gets frustrated with a lesson he can go out and play his trumpet. This calms him down and then when he's calmer he can go back to class. He has been on two trips with El Sistema and really enjoyed it. *'He had a certificate last year for improved music playing and improved behaviour as well. It was good for him to go away.'*

K's mother will support K in whatever he wants to do. *'If he wants to do music, that's fine. There is nothing worse than the parents saying you can't do this and you can't do that. It's what makes them happy. A good parent will back any decision that they make. It would be his*

choice. I'll help him all the way if that's what he wants. We've applied for a grant to buy him his own flute. We're just waiting to hear back. If we don't get it then we'll have to start saving.'

His mother reported the wider benefits of participating in *In Harmony* for K. *'It's helped his confidence massively – he's always been the quiet child. He can stand up in concerts in front of so many people and play and that's one hell of a boost especially when he gets to the end of it. I think music is good for the brain. Children get more academically ahead. It does something. As soon as they had their instruments I was all for it.'*

She also reported benefits for the family overall. *'It's brought them together a bit. It's something as a family they can talk about as well. That is something that doesn't often happen with four boys.'* She appreciates the opportunity that the children have had. *'As a whole it's an amazing opportunity they would never have had without this. It is something they really enjoy and focus on. It keeps them out of trouble and there's nothing worse than having kids in trouble.'*

Into the Future

K intends to carry on playing when he goes to secondary school. He will attend the Nucleo and the chamber orchestra after school. He wants to be a professional flautist, although he is unsure what exactly professional flautists do. He has watched people play the flute on YouTube and thinks he would like to be in an orchestra. He has recently been accepted onto this year's cohort of children for the National Orchestra for All and he has been invited to play with the Chamber Ensemble. His teacher believes that at secondary school and in the Chamber Ensemble he will *'experience a richer social life due to his early enthusiasm for music!'* For K himself he just wants to *'see if I can get better.'*

Case Study 15: Pupil J

This case study of J illustrates the importance of parental support and the tricky balance between protectiveness and developing independence. It also highlights the need to nurture and support out of school involvement at the earliest opportunity to cultivate that independence.

J is in Year 6 and has two older brothers – 18 and 12 – the youngest was a very talented player but he did not continue playing when he transitioned to secondary school. She wants to continue playing upon transition and is very determined young lady. She is outgoing, academically bright and very bubbly.

J is part of the pilot project being tested by *In Harmony* to assist young people who the team feel need additional support to transition to secondary school. This entails the support of a Family Support Worker, fun sessions with parents and support to attend the Youth Orchestra.

J's *In Harmony* Journey

J started playing trumpet in year 4 and is playing at Grade 3 standard. She attends Youth Orchestra and attended Band Camp which she loved and where she made new friends from other schools.

She loves playing and enjoys the challenges it presents: *" I love it when it is tricky and challenging."*

She points to the importance of her Mum's support: *"She helps me and I play for her and she cheers me on and comes to every concert. I feel like I am playing for her."*

Her mum claims that music is good for her well being – *"It lifts her spirits – she practices every night."* Mum is clearly very proud of her, supports her trying to balance independence with protectiveness and wants the best for her.

Neither Mum or J know what the musical offering is in the secondary school she will be attending – *"It wasn't a factor in our choice of school."* J feels it will be different and more challenging and is hoping she will be able to progress to higher grades. She fully intends to continue to play but is worried about what opportunities there will be as well as about the possible clash with other demands – homework, clubs etc.

Into the Future

Her mother is fully supportive of her playing and will help in any way she can to support her progression but, by her own admission, she is very protective and doesn't like her travelling alone so there will be logistical and transport challenges for J to continue with youth orchestra which takes place in the city centre. However, her mother claims that *"nothing will stop J. She will do it and we will support her along the way"* The family are hoping to move nearer to the school she will be attending in future.

"I want her to be more successful than myself, to do better in life, achieve, pass her exams and become something - a teacher even as artist!"

J herself says she wants to be a teacher and her music tutor said: *"She is naturally talented. She will be a teacher – she is very people orientated and loves instructing. She is like a TA to other younger pupils and loves organizing others for grade sessions. She has leadership qualities but is not domineering. She is composed and very mature for her years and I really hope we can keep her involved despite the challenges."*

3.6. Overcoming the Challenges

The earlier research stated that programmes, families and young people all reported many challenges to successful progression for all children transferring from primary to secondary school. These included the culture of secondary schools and their size and scale which can be intimidating after the relative intimacy of the primary school. Peer pressure which led to some young people hiding their involvement with *In Harmony* from peers. The availability of provision was also a major challenge for some.

The final two case studies illustrate these challenges well but show how two young people overcame the challenges to continue with their involvement in music.

Case Study 2: Pupil L

The case of L illustrates how different motivations can drive ongoing engagement and demonstrates how partnership working across agencies can also support progression.

L is now in year 10 and attends the local Academy. He has played a Double Bass since year 5 and joined the Centre for Advanced Training (CAT) in Year 6. His sister is currently in Year

6 and plays flute to Grade 3 level. She will progress to a different secondary school in September 2018.

L's In Harmony Journey

L's journey started in Year 5 when he chose to learn to play the Double Bass: *"It was big and not many other people wanted to play it but I thought it looked like fun."*

After a short time he advanced to the CAT in Year 6 but left after 2 years. He also stopped attending after school lessons at primary school when he was in Year 8. There appear to be many reasons for this including the logistics of transportation and a loss of motivation and some degree of peer pressure.

His music tutor stated: *"I think that L really enjoyed his bass lessons at CAT with D (who is still there) but I think that the end of year exam put him off in his second year. At the mention of an end of year assessment he, if my memory serves me correctly, suddenly was absent in the weeks before. I can't remember if he took the assessment but he then left the CAT. Looking back, although he was quite able and the assessments are quite informal I think he was a little young or not confident enough to take that on."*

L is a quiet young man with a slight lack of confidence in himself but he warmed during the interview and talked passionately about how he loves playing and is glad to have returned to it after a two year gap. His return is largely due to having joined Air Cadets:

"I joined Cadets (Air Training Corps) last year after a friend of my Mam's son told me about it. Me and my older brother joined. I realised that they do badges and one of them is in music so I came back to In Harmony because I needed help. It was hard to pick it up again after two years and I am behind where I should be but I am having as much fun as I did in year 6. I don't have the same tutor so that also makes it harder but I am getting used to T. Getting badges will show I have tried and achieved something – I can feel proud"

The squadron bought a Double Bass when they found out he played and so he can practice there when he attends. The band includes drummers, ukelele, flutes and violins.

It is clear that his return to *In Harmony* in January 2018 has been driven by a need to achieve more: *"I am doing OK in school – I don't get enough help from the teachers because the classes are so much bigger and I am in the lower sets but I am doing OK. I find it easier to get help here than elsewhere – I can achieve more and learn more and when I learn more I do a lot more."*

Playing the Double Bass means a lot to him: *"It has given me more experience. I can help others. I am not very sociable, I don't go out a lot and I needed to go and do something and Cadets gave me that and it is what has brought me back to music."*

His music teachers states: *"When I first started teaching L it was in a group of four and I thought that he was always aware and engaged in the lesson even though there were more outgoing pupils in the group. I noticed that his sister has a similar level of observation - clocking what is going on when there are more needy children in the session."*

His return to *In Harmony* has meant he now attends the Symphony Orchestra sessions as well as his sessions at Cadets and he talked about how this is very time consuming. He is looking forward to being able to take his Double Bass home after September for practice when travel logistics will allow his Dad to pick it up and drop it off when he drops his sister at *In Harmony*.

Into the Future

“ I like building stuff a lot. ”

L says he would like to be a mechanic or something linked to that as he enjoys working with his hands. His mum says *“he’s leaning towards apprenticeships – things like gardening and physical jobs”*

He feels that his experience in Cadets will help him to progress as well as his involvement with music: *“I want to give myself some advantages as I am not going to be a genius in school! Cadets is good for developing my confidence and leadership skills and will be good for my CV but so will being part of In Harmony. I am lucky to have both and hopefully it will help me to get the job I want when I leave school.”*

In his Mum’s words: *“He works hard enough, I can see him reaching his goal and getting those badges. I think he’d more than likely like to take a grade exam on his bass, again, in order to get the badge. He’ll be with the cadets until he’s 20. Transport will always be an issue, getting things to and from, the sheer size of the instrument! I’ll continue to help him as much as I can.”*

Case Study 16: Pupil D

This case study illustrates the impact on a sibling group of participating in In Harmony and how music has affected life chances, aspiration and choices. The eldest may no longer be playing but has a lifelong love of music and it has changed his life in many different ways. The importance of the role models provided by the music tutors is also evident.

D is 20 years old and no longer in school. He now works full time in catering and has two siblings – aged 6 and 13 – the youngest loves music and is involved in *In Harmony* provision through his Primary school and the middle sibling was one of the most committed of all the children and young people of *In Harmony*, although he no longer plays double bass upon progressing into to Year 9 at secondary school.

D’s In Harmony Journey

D is 20 years old. He started playing Cello in year 6 when *In Harmony* first started in 2009 and, despite only having lessons for one term in primary school, he chose to continue with West Everton Super Strings once he had left primary school, and continued to be a member of Everton Youth Philharmonic until two years ago. He successfully completed his GCSEs in Summer 2014 and went to University to study Teaching and Learning and Child Development with aspirations to become a teacher.

Unfortunately, after a year, D decided that the University course was not for him and left in 2017. *“I simply found I had no motivation and was worried about the loans. I couldn’t see myself completing the course as I don’t learn like that. I need to be learning through doing – Ian (RLP Cello Player and D’s tutor) always said I was a kinaesthetic learner - and I didn’t like the theory and the exams.”*

He sees the connection between this and his love of *In Harmony*: *“I didn’t want to take grade exams as I liked the In Harmony approach where you can take as much time as you want and there is no pressure ”*

His achievements on his *In Harmony* journey were manifold: *“His list of achievements as part of the programme are extensive, having performed many times leading the cellos in WESS, WECO and side by side performances with professionals and other In Harmony programmes. He has also given many chamber performances as part of the WESQ, where he has performed in master classes given by esteemed quartets such as the Libertadores String Quartet from Venezuela. He is an extremely committed performer, who will always give his all in a performance and strives to continually do his best. His commitment continues and achievements continue to serve as an excellent role model for his brother, who has recently joined as part of the Bass section in EYP, and he has also accompanied his pre school sibling to our Tots In Harmony sessions. He continues to exemplify what is expected from this older age group of young musicians, and through studying for his Silver Arts Award alongside 4 other young people, he played a crucial role in the planning and delivery of this year’s In Harmony Summer School, and continues to be a valued voice in the progression and expansion of Everton Youth Philharmonic.”* (Artistic Director, interviewed in 2016)

D went to Canada as part of the Sistema Music Education Exchange in July 2015. At the time he said; *“It was really fun, and I really enjoyed the way that music brought us all together to make friends from all over the world. It was great!”*

In an interview in 2018, he reflected *“The Canada trip was one of the best experiences of my life. In Harmony has given me the opportunity to meet new people, expand my social circle, develop life skills, grow more confidence and it helped me to focus and know what I want to do with my life and feel able to do it my way without pressure from anyone else.”*

D claims to love the cello because it is the instrument that sounds closest to the human voice – he finds it *“calming and soothing”*

“It changed me, I am more outgoing, positive and happier as a person. I used to keep myself to myself but now I am more confident. Music kept my mind on the same thing in some of my critical years when I was growing up. It gave me pride in myself. I am now a different person so I don’t feel that it matters that I don’t play any more. It made me a better person.”

The middle sibling is now 13 and no longer playing - he is now a mature and articulate young man with a strong sense of what might be possible in life. In year 5 he was accepted by Liverpool Football Club into the youth academy and is self motivated with strong aspirations: *“In Harmony has shown me that you’ve got a ladder. You can do things. You don’t have to stay the same in life. I know that I can do stuff”* There is no doubt in their mother’s mind that the role model provided by D supported and spurred on his sibling as he progressed through primary school. Similarly, that both young men have motivated their younger sibling to believe he too can be *“the best he can be.”*

Into the Future

He is now working full time in a pub but has plans to gain more knowledge of the industry, move into his own place in time and start his own pub. *“I am happy with where I am for the moment. I wouldn’t preclude taking another course at a later date but nothing jumps into my mind at the moment.”*

He is not playing at the moment and says there are many reasons for this: *“I stopped when I was in college as I couldn’t get to orchestra. I had shifts at work and University course work and just didn’t have the time. I didn’t feel I would fit into the Uni orchestras and ensembles either. I miss it. It helps with my mood. But, I don’t have the time – or a cello - and where*

would I play? What orchestra could I join now? The culture of amateur groups is not for me.”

D had been talking to his mentor and cello teacher and was starting to think that he might start something up himself: *“Why not? I could buy myself a cello now and enjoy playing in my own time at home. I don’t have to be part of an orchestra do I?”*

3.7. It is apparent from the stories outlined above that **a range of factors contribute to supporting successful progression**. These illuminate the earlier research rather than providing new data. They include:

- Good home school liaison and pastoral support can support progression;
- Proactive family support is crucial but there is a need for a balance between this and the need to generate independence;
- Professional Musicians acting as role models and mentors;
- Sibling support and modelling appears to be an important motivating factor;
- Where there are social elements to the activity provided young people are motivated to continue to take part;
- Where out of school activity is available at an early age, young people appear to become more independent participants taking greater responsibility and agency;
- Cross agency/ partnership working supports progression;
- Logistical and financial support mitigates against the barriers faced by many families;
- There is evidence that being ‘pushed’ hard to achieve motivates and helps to support progression.

Similarly, the stories illustrate the **barriers and challenges** that young people face in continuing with their involvement which were outlined in depth in the earlier research.

- Opportunities may be there but the power to take them is not within the control of the young person;
- Logistical barriers such as money, travel, the location of the secondary school or the time the school day ends are common and recurrent and again, often not within the control of the young person;
- Provision may not be available – and when it is, the style and approach may be different or the provision may be too elementary for the musical stage of development so it does not meet the needs of the young person;
- Complex and challenging home circumstances can be barriers to progression;
- Lack of parental engagement and support or even passive support is often a barrier.

4. The Action Research Projects:

4.1. The Projects

The projects were supported with an additional £5k funding from ACE and the *In Harmony* programmes were initially required to complete the project between January and July 2018.

¹In some cases summer holiday activity was proposed which led to an extension of this deadline to the end of September 2018. The projects were very different and met needs identified locally.

The proposed projects were all accepted without any consideration of what they were each testing and piloting so there is some duplication across the six programmes and many of the original findings are not being tested. For example, none tested homework clubs and the provision of food and drink before extra curricular sessions, whilst almost all programmes were testing the provision of a range of opportunities. Only one project tested the provision of support for parents in making decisions and no one looked at funding and guidance about accessing this which is a major barrier to progression. Further, there were differential levels of rigour in the proposals that have affected progress and outcomes.

Case studies of each project are contained in the appendices and these outline aims and learning in detail. Summaries of each project follow.

In Harmony Lambeth

Lambeth tested two interventions:

- A Summer Orchestral Holiday Course – 7th – 10th August 2018 - for 30 year 6 students bridging between primary and secondary school which will focus on building closer relationships with parents/ carers in preparation for progression to secondary school in September 2018.
- A formal Youth Voice programme between February and July 2018.

Areas of Focus:

- Create opportunities for young people to feed into future plans for *In Harmony* to empower them and increase the likelihood that they are successful;
- Be connected and have extensive partnerships with other local providers of music education opportunities.

In Harmony Leeds

Leeds developed Opera North Junior strings which was launched in January 2018 and was open to string players aged 10 – 14 across Leeds. The ensemble sought to support the development of outstanding musicianship, and offered *In Harmony* players the opportunity to develop a positive musical identity outside of their local area and make social networks with children from across Leeds in their final year of primary school. In addition, the running costs of minibuses were supported which enabled the children pursuing extra curricular activity outside of their immediate local area.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for *In Harmony* and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways;
- Provide subsidies, transport and logistical support where necessary.

¹ It should be noted that *In Harmony* Telford and Stoke, although one project, split the £5k grant to run two separate projects with £2.5k each.

In Harmony Liverpool

Liverpool tested two interventions:

- An intensive weekend Chamber Music course - building on pathways available to support young musicians, a weekend, intensive chamber course for *In Harmony* young musicians playing at Grade 4+ equivalent level;
- A pilot Pre-Associate membership scheme for individual young musicians - As part of Liverpool Philharmonic's commitment to encouraging progression in orchestral music making, Associate Membership of Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Orchestra is available to aspiring *In Harmony* musicians. The pilot **Pre-Associate Membership Scheme** for 3-4 identified *In Harmony* young musicians aims to drive individual skill, confidence and musical progression for *In Harmony* participants who have already reached a Grade 4* equivalent level and need additional resources to quicken their progress to the next level.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for *In Harmony* and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways;
- Offer pastoral support to young people;
- Provide subsidies, transport and logistical support where necessary.

In Harmony Newcastle Gateshead

Newcastle Gateshead worked in partnership with the regional Music Partnership North (Music Education Hub) to track musical progression and development post year 6. It was believed that the hub would provide greater access to information and enhanced communication with secondary schools. At the same time the team wished to pilot ways to track year 6 leavers.

Areas of Focus:

- Be connected and have partnerships with other local providers of music education opportunities;
- Be connected and have strong relationships with secondary schools where this is possible and have knowledge of the musical opportunities that they offer.

In Harmony Nottingham

Nottingham led a pilot project between January and October 2018 that sought to support musical progression and to create musical communities for young people outside of school with the aim of increasing the numbers of secondary age young people in Nottingham City engaging in music making:

- Identify 2 pilot schools and cohorts of year 5 and 6 pupils;
- Recruit a family support worker in each school;
- Hold a series of sharing and play events for families and siblings of targeted cohorts;
- Invite cohorts to join Area Band, RHYO Connect or RHYO Intermediate (as appropriate);
- Provide transport and supervision for children attending each of the groups;
- Facilitate meetings with secondary school music teachers introducing the specific cohort of pupils and families to their new school, music department and opportunities;

- Hold discussions with schools, pupils and families to evaluate the impact;
- Prepare Youth Music funding application to roll out the programme to the wider group of IH schools.

Areas of Focus:

- Offer pastoral support to young people;
- Provide subsidies, transport and logistical support where necessary;
- Be able to advise and support young people and their parents in making decisions about which musical progression opportunities to pursue;
- Be connected and have strong relationships with secondary schools where this is possible and have knowledge of the musical opportunities that they offer.
- Be tenacious in following up non-attendance in students recently transferred to secondary school
- Provide information to parents about the musical opportunities in local secondary schools

In Harmony Stoke

Stoke tested the development of an out of school orchestra based at Thistley Hough Academy. This orchestra built on best practice from *In Harmony* Telford and the successful orchestra that takes place at Old Park Primary. The orchestra was open to all pupils in Year 7 and 8 and Loquela (EAL unit) taking part in *In Harmony* with different playing abilities catered for. The new *In Harmony* orchestra was led by 3 members of *In Harmony* staff so that each instrumental discipline is catered for. The orchestra was also developed so that feeder primary school pupils were invited and links between KS2 - 3 are developed. School staff were also involved in the sessions, which upskilled non-instrumental specialist music teachers.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for *In Harmony* and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways

In Harmony Telford

Telford also tested a twofold approach:

- A short **Chamber Ensemble course** for the most engaged Year 5 and 6s which provided more performance opportunities. In 2017, a pilot Chamber Ensemble project took place for the most engaged Year 5s and 6s in the programme to inspire them to continue when they transitioned to secondary school. The project culminated in 4 performances in the local area at care homes and at the school fete. The pilot will include a similar project with a new cohort, learning from what we did last year, as they found that this was useful for retention and feeding into the Nucleo Orchestra and Youth Ensemble. The team were also seeking other opportunities for the Chamber Ensemble to perform in the same setting as the Youth Ensemble, to make the progression route visible to Chamber Ensemble members, and inspire them to continue on their instrument.
- Increase the number of rehearsals for the **In Harmony Youth Ensemble** to provide greater continuity. This ensemble is the first permanent ensemble to be run which children join on teacher recommendation only, once they reach a certain level of proficiency on their instrument. As Telford doesn't have any youth orchestras or ensembles for the children in the programme to progress to, this ensemble is intended to be the main vehicle for progression from the mixed ability ensembles. The pilot will be used to ensure the Youth Ensemble runs for 10 weeks per term, bringing greater continuity to the rehearsal period.

Areas of Focus:

- Provide a range of extra-curricular activities for *In Harmony* and other young people that is joined up and offers clear progression pathways

4.2. Tackling the challenges in different ways

The 7 projects tackled challenges identified in the earlier research as indicated in their areas of focus. The projects were selected to meet genuine needs identified by the programmes and were not systematic in addressing the earlier research findings and hence there was some overlap between them and some areas of the earlier findings were not addressed.

In Harmony Lambeth and Liverpool have been running for nearly 10 years so have already sought to tackle some of the challenges in maintaining involvement post primary school. For example, Lambeth has employed a number of strategies over the years to help with the transition from Y6 to Y7. Strategies have included:

- Building an expectation that children will continue with their ensembles once they have moved to secondary school
- Transition evenings at the end of Y6
- Poor attendance in Y7 is chased by the pastoral team
- Mentoring support for students in Y7
- The hub has communicated the musical details of transitioning students to secondary schools
- A homework club at the start of rehearsals to allow students to complete their school work
- Adjusting rehearsal times to allow students sufficient time to travel from their secondary schools to the IHL after-school centre

As part of Liverpool Philharmonic's commitment to encouraging progression in orchestral music making for young people, they have been offering Associate Membership to Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Orchestra (LPYO). This is a year-long programme aimed at nurturing and developing potential in young musicians through bespoke opportunities with LPYO (Grade 7+ level), Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Academy Orchestra (LPYAO) (Grade 4-7 level) and wider Youth Company activity. To date, two *In Harmony* participants have successfully gained Associate Membership and the learning from this programme has informed project design for this project.

It is important to note that Liverpool does not have a Centre for Advanced Training (CAT). In Newcastle Gateshead, the existence of the Centre for Advanced Training at Sage Gateshead provides coherent progression pathways for young people. Similarly, in Nottingham, where *In Harmony* is an integral part of the Music Education Hub's programme of work, the team have also been proactive in developing strategies so progression pathways are well established and coherent.

Each programme therefore faced different challenges and approached the research in different ways. Each programme was required to complete a self-evaluation template at the onset of the programme – see Appendix One – and this required them to identify their hypothesis and their aspired for outcomes as well as their planned outputs and activities. These informed both the research and the programme and the final Case Study which was written by each project team but edited for inclusion in the report.

4.3. Outcomes:

Outcomes can be grouped as follows:

- **Improved musical, social and leadership skills**

All projects have commented on aspects of this. The young musicians across the projects appear to have made accelerated progress, moving quickly through a range of ensembles and progression routes

Leeds report that *ONJS students have developed stronger sight-reading and ensemble skills allowing them to learn and perform increasingly more ambitious music.*

Liverpool reported: *“All participants have improved their ensemble skills through chamber music participation. They have demonstrated leadership of sections in high profile concerts and the individual confidence to perform with an accompanist for grade exams. Each participant has demonstrated improved commitment to their playing with increased at home practice, their attendance at a range of additional events and rehearsals and increased parental engagement and support. By taking part in a range of activities they got to perform new repertoire including chamber works and higher level symphonic repertoire.”*

- **Commitment to continued involvement**

Both Lambeth and Nottingham report early signs that young people have committed to ongoing involvement. Lambeth reported that of the 12 Y6 children who attended the course, 11 have continued playing in an ensemble in September 2018 (91%)

- **Wider friendship networks and the creation of music-making peer groups and support networks in individual schools and across them**

- Children in Y6 in Lambeth developed friendships with older children and London Music Masters.
- The year 6s in Nottingham interviewed during the project indicated that they already feel they have a very supportive music-making peer group although this is one based at school where they all learn together as a class. Building a similarly supportive network out of school will take longer than the pilot project but the team are positive that the programme of work supported this.
- In Liverpool it was noted: *“We, and their parents, observed them making new friendships with a wide range of young people including others at their schools who they had previously not met.”*

- **Greater parental involvement and increased understanding of opportunities by families**

Feedback from parents in several projects demonstrated that they had a clearer understanding of the progression routes for their children. In Lambeth this was helped by visiting the Lambeth Sounds Centre and meeting other parents from London Music Masters.

Nottingham reported that at the play sessions information was provided: *“This covered areas such as ensemble opportunities, teaching provision at secondary school, instrument loan service, fees and subsidies available, contact details for secondary school music teachers as well as more general information on the exam system, musical learning and how students progress, and the wider impact of music education.”*

Several projects reported feedback from parents demonstrating that they were very proud of the musical progress made by their children during the course

Leeds stated that *“Weekly communication to develop and nurture relationships with families has increased engagement and attendance at weekly ONJS rehearsals. Families now regularly communicate with Opera North Education, updating on attendance and*

feeding back on sessions. Families are invested in their child's involvement with ONJS and attendance at performances has increased."

- **Children have better understanding of the range of pathways available to them**

For example, three children joined the Lambeth Youth Symphony Orchestra in September.

- **Embedded provision**

All projects have embedded their learning and in most cases their provision if not in its entirety due to cost restraints. In Leeds Opera North Junior Strings is now an integral part of provision and in Liverpool, the Pre-Associate Membership scheme is now part of core provision. The Orchestra in Stoke is now embedded within the school.

Newcastle Gateshead will continue to liaise with their secondary schools and use the music portfolios on transition: *"The aim is to provide the vital information to the school music department so they can continue to support the children. In the music portfolio there will be a copy of their ABRSM achievements and comment sheet; Arts Award achievements; a report from their instrumental tutor and In Harmony Programme Leader and any other useful information."*

4.4 **Key Learning: What Works**

Drawing on the learning outlined in the Case Studies the following strategies and approaches appear to have been effective:

- **Family Liaison and Support** is an effective way to support young people and breaks down many barriers to engagements as well as building parental understanding, engagement and support.

"The key element in the success of the project has been the development of human relationships and the Family Support Worker (FSW) being able to build good, positive relationships with children and families and act as a kind of middle person between them and the lesser known music service staff has been vital. Anecdotal feedback from families is that having a central port of call in school for information and having a known person accompany children to ensembles has been really well received. It has become increasingly clear that current knowledge of the school, the staff, the systems as well as relationships with the children and families is why the role and therefore the wider project has been successful." (Nottingham) See Appendix 9 for the job description.

- **Engaging Parents early in the programme**

Play sessions worked well in Nottingham but it might just be about an open invitation to observe a session or a letter home, informal conversations build trust and confidence and that will be crucial.

- **Setting high expectations and striving for higher playing standards**

Several projects adopted approaches to accelerating progression. Several were selective - which runs against the inclusivity of the *In Harmony* programmes in primary school - but this appears to support progression as it is motivating.

Stoke reported: *"Some of the pupils who attend have been shy in lessons and needed extra encouragement to attend. The golden ticket acted as a great incentive and it was fantastic to welcome some students to the orchestra who have not engaged in other out of school opportunities."*

Other projects referred to setting progression targets that push the young person whilst recognizing that individual circumstances often mean that a flexible approach needs to be

taken and setting high expectations of what can be achieved and offering opportunities for accreditation/validation of achievement.

Leeds stated: *“We believe that higher musical standards will lead to an increase in opportunities for performance, higher levels of confidence and achievement and an increased level of engagement. It is hoped that this will, in turn, increase the number of children continuing to make music beyond.”*

Liverpool stated: *“if we pushed forward the musical progress of young people through a series of intensive interventions, including chamber provision, one to one lessons and an increased emphasis on personal practice, we would refine technique, enable youth leadership, harness ensemble skills, develop communication skills and introduce young people to a wider range of repertoire, enabling them to be ready to become an Associate, and ultimately a full member of LPYO sooner.”*

- **Summer holiday courses** that bridge between primary and secondary school and focus on transition.
- **Partnership working**– especially with the secondary schools and the Music Education Hubs - and across teams where appropriate supports the development of diverse pathways. Projects cited a wide variety of other partners including London Music Masters, the MEHs, the Ruth Gorse Academy in Leeds as well as internal partners such as the Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Orchestra.
- Providing **ensembles that span a wide range of year groups or across provision** can be an effective approach. *“The importance, and value, of encouraging children from different musical journeys (In Harmony/Music Hub provision/private tuition/Youth Orchestra) to work alongside each other to develop a shared love of music outside of previous musical/life experiences.”*
- **Logistical Support** – Leeds provided minibuses to transport young people.
- **Small cohorts - chamber and small ensemble provision** are approaches that proved effective across several projects. There also is a value in investing in **1 to 1 lessons** - with targeted goals as this can really accelerate progression.
- **‘Reunions’ and other social events** that provide opportunities for young people to come along, reconnect with each other and talk informally with tutors.

4.5. Key Learning: What was less successful

- The **timing** of interventions was a challenge in some projects – there will never be a right time;
- ‘Flexing’ and adapting programmes to **meet the needs of the individual young person** was a challenge in projects that were seeking to push musical standards;
- **Time and resources** are already stretched in the In Harmony programmes – priorities are multiple so there is a need to make choices. This also affects partners and their ability to support programmes of work;
- Contacting the **secondary schools** remained a challenge in most projects.

4.5. Critical Success Factors

It is possible to extrapolate some critical success factors that support activity that keeps young people engaged as they progress into secondary school.

- **After school activity which keeps attendance consistent** must -
 - Ensure students feel a continuous sense of technical and musical progression through a structured and engaging atmosphere;
 - Create a strong sense of identity around the afterschool provision, particularly within a wider context;
 - Support with transport supports not only attendance but builds camaraderie and a sense of identity
 - A sense of 'project' – working towards an outcome such as a performance – on a long-term project helps keep participant motivation high
- **Tailoring Approaches and Pathways for the individual** are crucial to stretch the young person and might include:
 - Individual development plans for young people with a range of development markers (eg grades, levels of engagement, learning new techniques)
 - 1:1 tuition to develop technical practice;
 - Targeted recruitment to activity to motivate – the 'golden ticket' approach
- **Joint working across partners** – especially the secondary schools and the Music Education Hubs - and across teams where appropriate supports the development of diverse pathways
- There is a crucial need to ensure that **pastoral support** is considered carefully and the young person receives the level of support that they need to successfully access activity

5. A framework for the future tracking and evaluation of musical progression by *In Harmony* participants as they move through secondary school

- 5.1. The gathering of consistent data across the *In Harmony* programmes has been affected by the changing indicators, a lack of consistency in the evaluation of impact across the programmes and this has implications for research that works across the programmes. When we look specifically at progression beyond primary school it was difficult to make any comparisons between programmes or to determine an accurate picture of retention patterns. Some projects had data whilst others did not.

Admittedly, tracking young people as they progress from infant school to primary is challenging for some of the *In Harmony* projects as they are dealing with so many different secondary schools and some are academies which do not have to provide the data.

Further each of the projects is led by organisations with different status, three are Music Education Hubs and three are led by National Portfolio Organisations. They therefore have different reporting mechanisms and requirements.

A national evaluation of the *In Harmony* programmes has recently been commissioned by ACE and may generate some consistent data but in the meantime, we have suggested a core set of quantitative indicators that may help to develop some consistency across the programmes across 2017/18 which can inform the national evaluation and be revised for 2018/19.

- 5.2. However, from a more quantitative perspective, it is suggested that the following might be achievable within resources:

- the Case Study children interviewed for this research could continue to be tracked by the projects and that projects might like to consider producing more case studies of individual children;
- that the reunion event that *In Harmony* held in Newcastle might be something that other projects want to adapt and adopt as a means of staying in touch with the young people who move on;
- that children who have taken part in the action research projects are tracked to assess long term effectiveness.

IN HARMONY CROSS PROGRAMME INDICATORS

SITES

Number of Primary Schools

Number of Nurseries/ Children's Centres

Number of Secondary Schools to which young people progress

REACH 2017/18

Total Number of Primary Pupils receiving in-class provision across the year

Total Number of Primary Pupils receiving extra curricular provision across the year

Total Number of Secondary Age pupils continuing to access provision across the year

Total Number of Early Years children receiving in-class provision across the year

ACTIVITY 2017/18

Total Number of Performances in year

Number of hours per week of musical activity offered in school time

Number of hours per week of musical activity offered out of school

List the Provision

PARTNERS

Total numbers of external partners (excluding schools)

List the Partners

WORKFORCE

Total number of musicians engaged in delivering the programme

6. Conclusions and Recommendations

- 6.1. *In Harmony* is a unique long-term intervention and as a site of learning it is rich and deep. Much can be learned from the programme to inform other music education interventions as well as other art form based interventions. This two part research programme has examined musical progression from primary to secondary through multiple lenses. A literature review was carried out which then led to an extensive research programme and report published in Autumn 2017. This report reflects a more practice based research approach of case studies of individual children that highlight the earlier research along with some action research projects.
- 6.2. The work has highlighted several things:
- The power of peer to peer learning within the *In Harmony* network and how a focus for a somewhat disparate group – in this case, secondary progression - can generate rich and deep learning, shared and next practice;
 - How small amounts of funding – in this case £5k - can enable risk taking and experimentation and generate new solutions to challenges being faced;
 - How small steps can contribute to a larger change within programmes.

It is recommended that the network consider further areas of inquiry that concern them all and set aside small sums each year within budgets for action research programmes/ risk in areas of mutual interest.

- 6.3. We have suggested a core set of quantitative indicators that may help to develop some consistency across the programmes across 2017/18 which can inform the national evaluation and be revised for 2018/19.

However, from a more quantitative perspective, it is suggested that the following might be achievable within resources:

- the Case Study children interviewed for this research could continue to be tracked by the projects and that projects might like to consider producing more case studies of individual children;
- that the reunion event that *In Harmony* held in Newcastle Gateshead might be something that other projects want to adapt and adopt as a means of staying in touch with the young people who move on;
- that children who have taken part in the action research projects are tracked to assess long term effectiveness.

APPENDICES

1. **Action Research Projects Evaluation Guide**
2. ***In Harmony* Lambeth Case Study**
3. ***In Harmony* Leeds Case Study**
4. ***In Harmony* Liverpool Case Study**
5. ***In Harmony* Newcastle Case Study**
6. ***In Harmony* Nottingham Case Study**
7. ***In Harmony* Stoke Case Study**
8. ***In Harmony* Telford Case Study**
9. **Job Specification for Family Support Worker – Mellers School Nottingham**

Appendix Two

In Harmony Lambeth

Context:

In 2009 *In Harmony Lambeth* (IHL) was launched with a mission to use music as a vehicle for social change in the SW8 community. To achieve this, the programme planned to work with children throughout their education. In 2012, IHL ended its separate after-school work at each partner school and developed a community wide after-school programme based at Wheatsheaf Community Hall to enable secondary school children to continue. Since then, IHL has been fairly successful in encouraging young people to continue with the programme once they have moved into year 7. However, for the programme to meet its community wide aspirations, it needs to increase the percentage of children continue their learning beyond Y6. In 17/18 60% of Y6 children who attended the after-school programme continued with IHL in Y7.

IHL has employed a number of strategies over the years to help with the transition from Y6 to Y7.

Strategies have included:

- Building an expectation that children will continue with their ensembles once they have moved to secondary school
- Transition evenings at the end of Y6
- Poor attendance in Y7 is chased by the pastoral team
- Mentoring support for students in Y7
- The hub has communicated the musical details of transitioning students to secondary schools
- A homework club at the start of rehearsals to allow students to complete their school work
- Adjusting rehearsal times to allow students sufficient time to travel from their secondary schools to the IHL after-school centre

Aims:

IHL was funded to deliver a social action research project to try to answer the following question? *Can a summer holiday course that **focuses on transition and youth voice** increase the number of children who continue learning an instrument into secondary school?*

IHL has previously delivered holiday courses, however the focus wasn't on transition. In the last holiday summer course in 2017, only 6 children in Y6 attended the course, and of these children, only 3 then continued into Y7.

Our belief was that the holiday period provided children and their families an opportunity to lose touch with the programme, especially with all the preparations and excitement of moving to a new school. We therefore wanted to explore if a holiday course project focusing on transition would help address this problem.

It was our hope that a summer holiday course would be an ideal time to support Y6 children their musical transition to secondary school. In addition, we believed that by delivery a project across the primary/secondary transition, this would help emphasise to Y6 children that it is the norm to continue with the programme into secondary school.

It was our aim to work with a minimum of 30 IHL children. In addition, to measure the effectiveness of this project, we aimed to ensure that at least 80% of y6 children who attend this course would then continue with the programme in Y7.

What we did:

To ensure economies of scale and to allow children to develop new friendship groups, we worked in partnership with London Music Masters to deliver this course. The course was based at the Lambeth Sounds (MEH) centre as we wanted a different rehearsal space that offered plenty of opportunity for small group activity. The final evening performance at the end of the course was at the Wheatsheaf

Hall in Stockwell. We selected this venue as the majority of children lived in this area and it was therefore easier for families and the wider community to attend.

The staffing was equally shared between In Harmony Lambeth and London Music Masters. As we felt it was important for young people to work with a new leader with a different approach, we engaged William Carslake to lead the course. In total 35 children attended from In Harmony Lambeth, plus 20 children from London Music Masters.

The holiday course activities included:

- A mass orchestra experience for all participants
- Sectionals
- Two differentiated orchestras
- Opportunities to play and socialise in break times
- Opportunities for the IHL after-school lead to discuss progression routes with Y6 students
- Creative workshops
- Mentoring, supported by older students
- Public speaking coaching
- Confidence and team building exercises
- A final formal evening concert, including opportunities to discuss progression routes for all children.

A total of 35 children and young people attended the course from year 5 to those aged 18-24:

Year Group	Number of participants
Year 5	3
Year 6	12
Year 7	5
Year 8	2
Year 9	6
Year 10	3
Year 11	1
Year 12	0
Year 13	0
18 - 24	3
Total	35

The major outcomes were as follows:

- Of the 12 Y6 children who attended the course, 11 have continued playing in an IHL ensemble in September 2018 (91%)
- Improved musical, social and leadership skills
- Children in Y6 developed friendships with older children from IHL and LMM
- Feedback from parents demonstrated that they had a clear understanding of the progression routes for their children. This was helped by visiting the Lambeth Sounds (MEH) centre and meeting other parents from LMM
- Children understood the range of the range of hub ensemble pathways. This was demonstrated by 3 children joining the Lambeth Youth Symphony Orchestra in September
- Feedback from parents demonstrated that they were very proud of the musical progress made by their children during the course

Of the 39 children who attend the after-school programme in Y6, 25 have continued with the programme in Y7. In addition, there are another 7 children who we expect to return to the programme by the October half-term. This is an 82% continuation rate.

To our surprise, our oldest IHL mentors, aged 18 - 24 attended the course. They led many of the break-out sessions and were able to mentor our Y6 students which was very effective

What we learned:

- Summer holiday courses are an effective way to support the transition into Y7
- Ensembles that span a wide range of year groups can be effective
- The informal conversations with children at lunch times are an effective way of supporting children with their musical transition. For example, the in-school lead was able to spend time discussing how to organise instrumental lessons at their new secondary-school.

We were particularly pleased with the effectiveness of the young leader's element of the course. Children took responsibility for music, repertoire choice, ensemble direction and the presentation of the final performance.

Unfortunately, the planned meetings with parents didn't take place. This was because parents often were unavailable during the middle of the day. However, the in-school lead was able to chat with parents when they came to collect their children and after the final performance.

We would have liked great numbers of Y6 children to have attended the course. However, due to holidays, school inductions and other music hub partner courses, it was difficult to find a perfect period of time to run the course. It was good for Y5 children to begin to understand the transition options for Y6 to Y7

Statistically, the project was successful as the number of children who continued with the programme into Y7 increased compared to previous years. However, the holiday course was part of a number of different strategies employed by the programme. It is therefore difficult to exactly quantify the success of this intervention.

What we plan to do next:

By working in partnership with London Music Masters and the Lambeth Sounds MEH, we were able to keep the project costs to a minimum. However, to deliver this course again we would need to source additional funding.

We believe that holiday courses are an effective way to support progression. If budget allowed, we would deliver two holiday courses to ensure greater reach. In addition, we would explore the option of a residential course to provide a more immersive experience, providing greater opportunities for 'informal' discussion and encouragement.

The mentoring and youth voice aspects of this holiday course were very effective. We plan to explore how the learning from this can be utilised in the after-school programme.

Appendix Three

In Harmony Leeds

Aims:

In Harmony Opera North has faced challenges since the start of the programme encouraging good numbers of pupils to continue playing their instruments and making music beyond primary school. Several different models for after-school music-making for secondary age pupils had been tried, including 3 times a week music provision for pupil's year 4-6 and secondary age in a setting outside of the schools they attend, with a less structured delivery style. Numbers have consistently been low despite high pupil enjoyment of the programme in year 6.

In order to increase the number of pupils accessing *In Harmony* Opera North out of school provision, and those continuing to make music as they transition to secondary school, we intended to address the following recommendations from the Research in to Progression:

- Support CYP to start engaging with a range of extra-curricular music activity from an early age to develop a positive musical identity outside of school
- Set high expectations of what can be achieved and offer opportunities for accreditation/validation of achievement
- Strive for higher playing standards to ensure students are able to access appropriate progression routes from/beyond *In Harmony* Opera North and Opera North Junior Strings
- Ensure regular performance opportunities
- Encourage greater independence by providing opportunities for holiday courses and activity outside of the local area
- Offer a choice of instrument.
- Provide subsidies, transport, funding advice, advice on what opportunities to take up and logistical support where needed.

What we did:

- Creation of a new after school programme, Opera North Junior Strings
- Restructure and expansion of choice of instruments in year 5
- Transport, funding and parental support for all Opera North after school activity, plus links with other Leeds Music Education Hub partners

Opera North Junior Strings

Launched in January 2018, Opera North Junior Strings (ONJS) has become established as a progression route for 14 KS2 *In Harmony* students, 7 *In Harmony* school leavers, and 4 additional 'non-*In Harmony*' students from Leeds, Wakefield and Halifax schools to continue making high-quality music outside of school. Weekly rehearsals took place in the Howard Assembly Room at Opera North (a multi-arts performance venue) which provided an aspirational home base for the ONJS participants in the heart of Leeds.

Performance highlights include a combined *In Harmony* North gala performance at *Sage Gateshead* as part of *In Harmony* Newcastle's sixth anniversary celebrations. Along with students from Newcastle and Liverpool, ONJS students shared their 'ideas for the future world' which inspired a new work by Stephen Deazley's *I wonder if...* and its performance alongside musicians from *In Harmony* Newcastle and Liverpool.

ONJS have also performed two additional concerts for family, friends and Opera North staff in the Howard Assembly Room at Opera North. ONJS branded performance uniforms have created a strong sense of identity and pride for the students, particularly when performing with other *In Harmony* projects and youth ensembles.

Transport

Opera North contributes to the costs of a minibus for two of the *In Harmony* schools. These are used weekly to transport children to the after-school ensembles at The Ruth Gorse Academy, as well as to ONCC. In addition Opera North Education provides personalised advice and subsidies to support students to access appropriate extra-curricular activities, such as: ONJS, YYM (Yorkshire Young Musicians), Orchestra Camp, Opera North Children's Chorus/Young Voices.

Restructure and expansion

In Harmony Opera North has undergone a curriculum restructure to ensure that all pupils at *In Harmony* partner primary schools are supported to reach their full musical potential by the time they transition to secondary school. Our assessment is that higher musical standards will lead to an increase in opportunities for performance, higher levels of confidence and achievement and an increased level of engagement. It is hoped that this will, in turn, increase the number of children continuing to make music beyond the structured primary school model.

The key features of the restructure are:

- Smaller ensemble sizes at primary school from September 2018 with the aim of supporting the raising of musical standards;
- Training provided to EYFS and KS1 class teachers to embed early years musicianship work throughout the curriculum;
- Every pupil will have the opportunity to trial flute, clarinet, trumpet, trombone and French horn in Year 5 and change their instrument choice at this point if applicable. This aims to ensure that every pupil plays the instrument that they feel most drawn to in the last two years of primary school.
- A consolidated after school instrumental and choral programme, on The Ruth Gorse Academy site, drawing together young musicians from The Ruth Gorse Academy and all 4 participating primary schools. Opera North Junior Strings will continue for those secondary aged students not attending The Ruth Gorse Academy.
- Justin Fung took up post as Orchestral Education Leader in November 2017 and has taken on artistic leadership of Opera North Junior Strings, leadership of *In Harmony* ensembles, and has completed a comprehensive *In Harmony* Scheme of Work which will monitor progress and aim for all participating pupils to reach their full musical potential by the time they leave primary school.

What we learned:

ONJS has provided weekly opportunities for Year 6 – 9 students to continue making high quality music outside of school. Led by members of the *In Harmony* Opera North teaching team and players from the Orchestra of Opera North, ONJS students have developed stronger sight-reading and ensemble skills allowing them to learn and perform increasingly more ambitious music. ONJS have performed in their branded performance uniforms, proudly representing their schools and Opera North.

Weekly communication to develop and nurture relationships with families has increased engagement and attendance at weekly ONJS rehearsals. Families now regularly communicate with Opera North Education, updating on attendance and feeding back on sessions. Families are invested in their child's involvement with ONJS and attendance at performances has increased.

The project is continuous, as is the learning. So far, we have learned that the following components make up after school activity which keeps attendance consistent:

- Ensuring students feel a continuous sense of technical and musical progression through a structured and engaging atmosphere
- creating a strong sense of identity around the afterschool provision, particularly within a wider Leeds context
- Support with transport through the minibuses has been essential, not only with attendance but with building a camaraderie the sense of identity

- A sense of ‘project’ – working towards an outcome such as a performance – on a long-term project helps keep participant motivation high
- The strength of partnership at all In Harmony schools has been essential in terms of the practical support over minibus journeys and keeping attendance high.

What we plan to do next:

The cost of the progression work on the programme is covered in the overall *In Harmony* Opera North budget, approx. 50% of which comes from school contributions.

Monitoring is taking place with after school participants, their school teachers, parents/carers and Opera North delivery artists, to ensure attendance, engagement and learning is kept at a high level.

This is done through the gathering of statistics, anecdotal feedback, focus groups and team reflection sessions.

The Ruth Gorse Academy has become an *In Harmony* Opera North partner school; their contribution to IHON covers the cost of this programme. These learning outcomes from ONJS provide a solid foundation of knowledge to create and develop this new afterschool programme at The Ruth Gorse Academy. From the outset, this will ensure accessibility and engagement are high and barriers are kept to a minimum.

Appendix Four

In Harmony Liverpool

Aims:

As part of Liverpool Philharmonic's commitment to encouraging progression in orchestral music making for young people, we have been offering Associate Membership to Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Orchestra (LPYO). This is a year-long programme aimed at nurturing and developing potential in young musicians through bespoke opportunities with LPYO (Grade 7+ level), Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Academy Orchestra (LPYAO) (Grade 4-7 level) and wider Youth Company activity. To date, two *In Harmony* participants have successfully gained Associate Membership and our learning from this programme has informed project design for this project.

The aim of this project was to develop, pilot and evaluate a Pre-Associate membership scheme, targeted at young people who were taking part in sustained music-making through *In Harmony*. Our hypothesis was that if we pushed forward the musical progress of young people through a series of intensive interventions, including chamber provision, one to one lessons and an increased emphasis on personal practice, we would refine technique, enable youth leadership, harness ensemble skills, develop communication skills and introduce young people to a wider range of repertoire, enabling them to be ready to become an Associate, and ultimately a full member of LPYO sooner. We also aimed to introduce *In Harmony* young musicians to development opportunities outside of *In Harmony*, including Youth Company masterclasses, workshops and projects which would encourage them to communicate and engage with new pastoral and artistic staff and other young people from different musical experiences and backgrounds, broadening their musical and social networks.

We have evaluated the effectiveness of this project through a number of means – teacher/musician feedback, interviews with young people and their parents and reflection by the project leaders (*In Harmony* and Youth Company staff). We have looked at the processes that we put in place to manage the project, activities delivered, impact on the participants, what we would do differently next time and how to further develop sustainable approaches to accelerate the musical progression of *In Harmony* participants.

What we did:

The project was led and implemented by a team of managers from *In Harmony* and Youth Company. We identified a team of musicians (15 in total) who would work with the individual young people as 1:1 teachers, sectional coaches and chamber music tutors. These musicians were selected due to their excellence in teaching and also as inspirational players. We put together an application process for pre-associate membership which asked young people to reflect on why they wanted to take part. We accepted 3 young people onto the scheme. All 3 were at Grade 4 ABRSM equivalent level at the start of the project. For all of the young musicians, we assessed their current instrument, and purchased a new violin for one of them in order to support his accelerated progress.

Each participant was able to access the following programme of activities:

- 4-7 April 2018: Attendance at **Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Academy Orchestra**. We provided funded places for *In Harmony* musicians (Grade 4+) and additional support where required (eg transport). We introduced participants to high quality, extended repertoire at Grade 4-7 standard, refining orchestral ensemble and technique through a 4 day intensive course. Repertoire included: Copland Hoe Down, Bernstein Mambo and Stravinsky Firebird
- 19-20 May 2018: A **weekend chamber music course** for 16 musicians divided into 4 chamber ensembles (string, wind and brass ensembles). Professional chamber coaches shared their passion, skills and expertise to drive the development of young musicians at Grade 4-8 level, providing them with specialist chamber music input, and development of their instrumental, chamber and ensemble skills culminating with a sharing performance for families.

- **Individual instrumental lessons** with Liverpool Philharmonic musicians, individually selected to provide the best support and outcomes for each participant. All participants had 10 one to one lessons through the project, with the lessons focussed on exam and audition preparation support, as well as wider technical and musical development.
- **ABRSM Grade 5 exams:** Aaron and Josh both passed their ABRSM Grade 5 examinations in Violin and Clarinet respectively in July 2018. Due to family holiday and other school commitments, Hollie’s entry for the Grade 5 exam was postponed into the next academic year.
- **Sistema Europe Youth Orchestra (SEYO):** the pre-associate members all auditioned successfully for SEYO in summer 2018 and took part in the 10 day residential course at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire.

As outlined below, a number of other young people from both *In Harmony* and Youth Company benefitted from the group activities. This enabled us to both compare outcomes with those who were not on the Pre-Associate programme and also broaden social networks of participants.

What we learned:

Project outputs:

Activity	No of Pre Associate participants	No of other In Harmony Liverpool participants	No of other participants
April - Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Academy Orchestra	3	9	40
May - Chamber Music Course	2	7	8
July - In Harmony Summer School Chamber project	1	5	3
August - Sistema Europe Youth Orchestra	3	4	200
April – September One to one lessons (10 per participant)	3	N/A	N/A
Audition preparation/practice auditions	3	N/A	N/A

Progress against project outcomes:

We had originally planned that the *In Harmony* young musicians would be ready to audition to become Associate Members of LPYO in September 2018. Although the participants are not currently ready to do this we have made strong progress as outlined below:

Outcome: Working at grade 6 equivalent standard on their instrument at time of audition

All young musicians have made accelerated progress, moving quickly through a range of ensembles and progression routes. Having recently passed their Grade 5 ABRSM and taken part in the SEYO course in August, two participants are working towards Grade 6 repertoire. The third will be taking her Grade 5 shortly. Over the next few months, one will be offered an advice audition with a member of the Youth Company artistic team with the view of a formal audition for LPYO Associate Membership in Spring 2019. Another pre-associate member is engaging with Youth Company composition workshops in September 2018, and all 3 are expected to take part in LPYAO in October 2018.

Outcome: Demonstrating potential to become an excellent ensemble musician

All participants have improved their ensemble skills through chamber music participation. They have demonstrated leadership of sections in high profile concerts and the individual confidence to perform with an accompanist for grade exams. They all participated fully in LPYAO and SEYO and one

participant commented that with SEYO, despite language barriers participants communicated through music.

In relation to the Chamber Weekend a participant said that he *“learnt to listen and how parts link together to find the harmony”*. Another noted that *“playing in an orchestra you get to hear all the other sections but you won’t hear yourself as much”*. A parent said that *“he loved it, it was amazing, he felt good about himself. He was so proud of himself”*.

Outcome: Committed to developing their musical knowledge and technical skills; Motivated and enthusiastic about learning and performing classical music, including managing their own practice.

Each participant has demonstrated improved commitment to their playing with increased at home practice, their attendance at a range of additional events and rehearsals and increased parental engagement and support, as evidenced by family attendance at activities such as SEYO and through parent interviews. Each participant kept a practice diary and were motivated to prepare for and take exams, one saying that he had *“sacrificed stuff”* to prepare. Of the Chamber Weekend, a musician said of one participant *“He was focussed throughout and impressed me as he was the only member of the group to take his part home and practise it in between day one and two”*.

The impact of 1:1 lessons was strong on each participant: One said: *“The best part about having one to one lessons with Ben is having someone I can ask questions to. In the past I have relied on my mum and dad to ask questions and talk about plans, however I now feel I can ask for myself. I feel having one to one time has helped me with my music and confidence as our time is more focused. I feel it has helped me in other areas of music, building my confidence of my own ability. As a result I have decided to take GCSE music”*. Another said: *“I can make more sound with my instrument and be more confident”*

Parents noted that their children were much more confident as a result of lessons. One parent talked about how they had been watching videos of Sheku Kanneh-Mason talking about how he balanced music with academic studies. Another said that the bond between their child and his teacher was *“absolutely awesome...Joshua has opened up to her...this has really helped him as a person and his growing up.”*

Looking at the longer-term impact one young person said, *“In 5 years, I will definitely still be playing my cello and I hope that I have chosen a career which includes music in some form. I also really hope that I will be a part of the Liverpool Philharmonic Youth Orchestra.”* Another said that he wanted to carry on playing for all his life because *“it’s a really important part of me.”*

Outcome: Interested in meeting wider social networks of like-minded peers through music making activities and performances; Performing an expanded repertoire of pieces from a wide range of genres.

Each young person enthusiastically auditioned for SEYO and engaged fully with LPYAO. We, and their parents, observed them making new friendships with a wide range of young people including others at their schools who they had previously not met. By taking part in a range of activities they got to perform new repertoire including chamber works and higher level symphonic repertoire. One young person noted that it was the first time that he had seen a bassoon. Another said, that *“I was worried at first about taking part in Youth Academy Orchestra as I was used to playing and learning from people I have known for a long time, after some persuasion from my mum I took part and loved it. I got to meet new friends, make great music and realise it’s good to push yourself and step out of your comfort zone.”*

A parent talked about the motivation of his child to go to LPYAO in holiday time when his brother and sister were having a lie in - *“he is loving it so is driving to go...despite being tired. Music is helping him as a young guy growing up”*. Another parent said that *“At the beginning we needed to bring him but now he can find his own way and be independent.”*

Of SEYO all the young people spoke about the impact of meeting young people from across Europe and learning about different cultures. Comments included *“we created an amazing sound when we all played together”* and *“normally when I play I don’t show much passion but in SEYO I started showing more passion.”*

Unexpected outcomes

Over the course of the Pre-Associate membership scheme there were several things that were unexpected. The rate of progress for each young person was different mainly due to other priorities, holidays, etc, and therefore timeframes for development opportunities needed to be adjusted to accommodate. The chamber weekend project and *In Harmony* summer school chamber activities (which were programmed in as a direct result of the success of the Chamber Weekend) provided a new environment for Pre-Associate and other young people, and was successful in achieving our outcomes and offering a new experience. The level of social development each pre-associate member achieved over the programme exceeded expectations with measurable improvements in their musical and self-confidence, even if, on reflection, the full range of the musical objectives that we set were perhaps too ambitious.

What we plan to do next:

Pre-Associate membership has provided an opportunity for us to test and review how we work with young people at a pivotal point in their musical journey, and we will continue this approach to accelerating progression, with the critical ingredients being:

- Individual development plans for young people with a range of development markers (eg grades, levels of engagement, learning new techniques)
- 1:1 tuition to develop technical practice;
- Targeted recruitment to Youth Company activity and beyond;
- Further developed joint working across Youth Company and *In Harmony* teams.

Going forward we will look to extend timeframes for progression, offer more individual support to young people and integrate personal and social development opportunities. We have realigned our staffing to embed the approach including adding progression as a priority for the new *In Harmony* Coordinator post, and ensuring Pre-Associate members and their families have a stronger relationship with the Youth Company administrative team.

Pre-Associate membership has been an effective way of supporting progress for children from *In Harmony* Liverpool, and with additional investment and development this can be an embedded pathway for children with potential to progress to more complex and technically challenging musical opportunities within Liverpool Philharmonic and beyond. We will develop different talent development options for younger children or children who require more support, and are exploring expanding this offer beyond *In Harmony* children.

We have learnt some interesting lessons around what works on progression journeys and this learning has potential for dissemination in other organisations and settings. This includes:

- While it is important to set progression targets, individual circumstances often mean that a flexible approach needs to be taken;
- In moving young people from a programme like *In Harmony* to other provision, the need to ensure that pastoral support is considered carefully and the young person still receives the level of support that they need to successfully access activity;
- The value of chamber and small ensemble provision in accelerating progression;
- The value of investing in 1 to 1 lessons - with targeted goals this can really accelerate progression;
- The importance, and value, of encouraging children from different musical journeys (eg *In Harmony*/Music Hub provision/private tuition/Youth Orchestra etc) to work alongside each other to develop a shared love of music outside of previous musical/life experiences

Appendix Five

In Harmony Newcastle Gateshead

Aims:

Our aim was to track the musical progress of all ex-pupils from Hawthorn Primary School who had been part of the *In Harmony* Newcastle Gateshead programme. We did this by trying to contact the Heads of Music at eight secondary schools across Newcastle that we knew the children had moved to when continuing their education. Music Partnership North, Newcastle and Northumberland Music Education Hub offered to help us do this.

We recognised that transition from primary to secondary education can be very challenging for many children. Our motivation was to ensure that the *In Harmony* Newcastle Gateshead children continue to be able to access musical activity after they have left the primary school. Tracking musical progression and development post year 6 has been difficult and this project has focussed us on gathering the relevant data, providing pathways and understanding the barriers to continued engagement in music making. We believe that building a link between *In Harmony* Newcastle Gateshead and the Heads of Music in secondary schools will help to ensure that the children have a better chance of continuing instrumental learning, either at their new school or with *In Harmony*. This pilot research aimed to establish lines of communication between *In Harmony* Newcastle Gateshead and the secondary schools to make sure the school is aware of each child's musical experience and achievements, to continue to support their learning.

By re-establishing contact with ex-pupils, we also aimed to recruit more young players for the West Newcastle Symphony Orchestra (WNSO). We currently have just over twenty regular attenders either in Year 6 or at secondary school. We have seen around 10% of children from each year 6 group continue to attend after leaving Hawthorn Primary School.

By working with the Music Education Hub, we aimed to establish multiple musical pathways for ex-pupils, recognising that some may want to continue playing music but not with *In Harmony*. If the Heads of Music in secondary schools and the Music Education Hub are aware of the musical experience and abilities of Hawthorn Primary School ex-pupils they can help to offer other musical pathways.

What we did:

We met with the Music Education Hub to work out how we could share data, without breaching any new GDPR regulations. They supported us in contacting each Head of Music at secondary schools and initiated two meetings. We provided the schools with information and data on the musical experience and ability of each child. We were then able to discuss their musical progress after leaving Hawthorn School. In addition, we met Heads of Music from two more secondary schools and they identified ex *In Harmony* children in their school and shared musical progress that had been made by the children. We found the meetings to be extremely useful and we discovered a lot about what the children had been doing musically since leaving Hawthorn Primary School and at what level they were now at.

In September we held an *In Harmony* Newcastle Gateshead Reunion at the West End Women and Girls Centre. The centre is very near to Hawthorn Primary School and is the venue where West Newcastle Symphony Orchestra (WNSO) meet. They rehearse here because the facilities are very good and its embedded in the community. For the secondary ex-pupils, it means they are not going back to the primary school. The decision to use West End Women and Girls as a venue was based on feedback members of WNSO gave when we first established the orchestra.

The centre helped to advertise the event and provided catering. The reunion was also marketed by invitation (attached) to each child who had left Hawthorn Primary School since *In Harmony* began in 2012. 41 children attended the reunion, 25 of whom were not members of WNSO. It was an informal event and through conversations over pizza and chips we gained a better understanding of the barriers

the children face in continuing their music making and whether they were still playing an instrument of any kind.

Looking ahead and taking into account feedback from the children who attended, we have decided to hold a reunion event every year. Instruments will be available and along with the opportunity for informal playing to gently encourage those who have not picked up an instrument for a while. Some children who attended were disappointed that their instrumental tutor was not at the event. Some of the tutors have left *In Harmony* and not all current tutors attended. In planning next year's event we will ensure more *In Harmony* tutors attend and we will support children to engage with new members of the team.

What we learned:

The meetings with the Heads of Music in secondary schools were invaluable in terms of gathering data about children's progress. Unfortunately, due to time constraints, meetings were not held with every school to gather all pupil data. In these meetings, we discussed each child individually, and in many cases the Head of Music was not aware that the child played an instrument. This highlighted the first problem: the children do not tell their new school that they play an instrument, even if they leave Hawthorn Primary School with an ABRSM qualification.

The meetings with the Heads of Music has enabled us to create a system which supports each child's progression once they leave Hawthorn Primary School. The data for each child has been recorded in a master spreadsheet that will be used in future years, enabling us to track progress of each child leaving Hawthorn Primary School. The meetings also enabled the In Harmony Manager to understand what each school offers, which will support musical progression.

Outcomes of meetings with Heads of Music:

Sacred Heart	Most students did not tell the school that they play an instrument. Even the student who attends WNSO and Young Musician's Programme, Step Up at Sage Gateshead did not engage in musical activity at school. Instrumental lessons are offered, free to children who receive Pupil Premium. Multiple orchestras/bands/choirs are offered.
Excelsior Academy	The Head of Music is aware of the students from Hawthorn Primary School. Many students continued playing and opted for instrumental lessons. Most had dropped off by the time they got to Year 9. Wind band and string band offered as ensembles.
Dame Allen's (Private School)	2 children attend Dame Allen's School, both still engage with music. The Head of Music was unaware of a second instrument for one child and was not fully aware of the children's level of attainment when they entered Year 7.
Wallbottle Campus	Most students did not tell the school that they play an instrument. The Head of Music was surprised by the list of names of children from Hawthorn Primary School. No ensembles offered at school, students can have instrumental lessons, free to children who receive Pupil Premium. Head of Music has now engaged the two children in Y7 and started them with instrumental lessons.

Going forward the challenge is to connect with the Head of Music at each of the remaining four secondary school's. Although we tried to connect through the Music Education Hub, as mentioned previously, this took longer than expected and time constraints became an issue. For schools we have connected with, we will provide information on each child before they go to the school in September. Data protection is the main challenge to sharing information, in addition the ABRSM exam results are not published until the Summer holidays.

We have decided to create a music portfolio for each child to give to Heads of Music in secondary schools in the first few weeks of term in September. The aim is to provide the vital information to the school music department so they can continue to support the children. In the music portfolio there will be a copy of their ABRSM achievements and comment sheet; Arts Award achievements; a report from their instrumental tutor and *In Harmony* Programme Leader and any other useful information. Portfolios have been collated and sent to Heads of Music for the Year 7 class who have just left Hawthorn Primary School.

The reunion was much more successful than we had imagined it would be. Children up to the age of 16 (year 12), who were only involved with *In Harmony* for 1 year, attended and were happy to discuss positive memories of *In Harmony* Newcastle Gateshead. One child commented that they initially continued music at their secondary school and felt pressure to take GCSE music. He chose not to take GCSE and consequently stopped attending instrumental lessons. One child commented that he was delighted to still be playing and was hoping to achieve Grade 6. He is taking GCSE Music at Excelsior Academy and we will track his progress and continue to encourage his return to orchestral playing. Many children commented on how easy they found curriculum music, particularly playing keyboards/drums, because of their music education at Hawthorn Primary School. Some children expressed an interest in returning to WNSO, contact details were given to those who expressed interest and we emphasised that they are welcome to return at any point. As with the case study with L, we know this is still possible.

What we plan to do next

The music portfolio system will be used every year as the children make the transition from primary to secondary education. We are hopeful of positive responses and engagement from all the Heads of Music in secondary schools in the form of more regular meetings and sharing of information, musical opportunities and pathways. We will continue to take note of past children's progress and remain open to any child returning. For those that do return we will be prepared to accommodate them at a musical level they will be comfortable with, which will include having easier orchestral parts available for children who might need to take step back in their music making before stepping up again. In conversations at the reunion we emphasised that anyone considering returning should not worry about needing to be as good as they were when they left Hawthorn School. It would be interesting to see if other national *In Harmony* projects provide secondary schools with information and what impact that has had on transition and progression.

After the success of this reunion event, we will also host a reunion every year. We will improve on it by asking the children who attended for feedback, and we will invite all *In Harmony* tutors, past and present, as well as class teachers from Hawthorn Primary School.

Looking further ahead, we have had initial conversations with the Music Education Hub about bringing their orchestral activity closer to the work we are doing with WNSO. This could be achieved in a variety of ways:

- A sharing day for both orchestras (the Music Education Hub and WNSO) which could feature some of the same repertoire so that the orchestras get an opportunity to play together.
- A 'Come and Play Day' for children across the city. This could be a recruitment exercise that would also attract any children who had lapsed in their instrument playing or have been unable to have an opportunity to continue playing due to changes in their life circumstances such as changing schools or moving to another part of the city/region
- Engaging more closely with Newcastle University/Sage Gateshead on a piece of research being led by Karen Laing from the University. At present this is focusing on parental involvement with *In Harmony* through side by side instrumental learning.
- WNSO performances at secondary schools.

Appendix Six

In Harmony Nottingham

Aims:

Our proposal was to support musical progression by working intensively with small cohorts of year 5 and 6 pupils in three of our *In Harmony* Gold schools.

Whilst many factors are directly related to provision (or lack of) in secondary education there are also social and personal factors affecting individual progression between KS2 and KS3, such as:

- Lack of parental understanding
- Lack of parental support
- Conflicting parental priorities – i.e. siblings or working patterns
- Impact of travel time and cost
- Lack of practice space

Our aim was to increase the number of secondary age young people in Nottingham City engaging in music making by creating accessible and inclusive out of school musical communities

Objectives

- To facilitate engagement in out of school ensembles
- To develop active music-making peer groups
- To create an ethos where music is inclusive and not elitist
- To create support networks for young people accessing out of school music provision

What we did:

By the end of July 2018 we had:

- Carried out reading and research to support the development of the project
- Identified and confirmed the participation of 3 schools (although only 2 eventually participated in the main project – see below for more information)
- Recruited a Family Support Worker in both schools
- Identified year 5 and year 6 cohorts in each school and compiled background information on all students
- Agreed on the structure for each project in collaboration with the Family Support Worker and lead NMS teacher in school.
- Year 6 students from Mellers Primary School attended the service Spring Concert on the 1st May
- All students regularly attended out of school ensembles between early May and end of June
- Held 2 family play sessions at each of the 2 schools
- Held weekly practice sessions at each school
- Both RHYO Connect groups and all Area Bands performed at the service Summer concert on the 27th June

The brief for identifying small groups of children to be involved in the project was clear. As this was a pilot project exploring approaches to support transition we wanted to limit the number of other challenges and looked to recruit children:

- Who were showing ability and commitment in their *In Harmony* lessons
- Who had supportive and engaged families
- Who weren't already attending Grade 1+ ensembles

The children were identified in discussion with class teachers and music service staff and then approached by letter via the Family Support Worker who then did a fair amount of cajoling and

encouraging to build understanding and trust from the families. This took longer at William Booth than at Mellers primary school, probably because the FSW at William Booth was less well known to the families as she was ordinarily based in foundation stage rather than KS2. Eventually, the cohort consisted of 11 students at William Booth Primary School (6 in year 5 and 5 in year 6) and 10 at Mellers Primary School (5 year 5s and 5 year 6s). The cohort at William Booth was initially larger but 3 students were ruled out either through self-de-selection or due to family circumstances (one had moved out of the area and participation after school was extremely difficult).

Area Band and RHYO Connect

Year 5 students from the target cohort have been attending Area Band sessions for the last 5 or 6 weeks of term. These are after school ensembles for beginner players held at each of the schools. The Family Support Workers have supported the families with the necessary registration forms and have been attending the sessions encouraging attendance and participation. The targeted year 6 students have all been attending RHYO Connect sessions for the last 7 weeks of term. RHYO Connect is a stage further on than Area Band and targets students post grade 1 usually from school years 5, 6 or 7. Whilst out of school and not on the individual school grounds the students have been transported (either walking together or by taxi) and accompanied to each session by the FSW who again supported families with the necessary enrolment forms, we have also waived the registration fees for this group.

Family Play Sessions

The first family play session was held at Mellers Primary School on Wed 2nd May 2018 and at William Booth Primary School on Thurs 10th May. The aim of this session was to introduce the project to the students and families and to start building relationships with the group. The second family play sessions took place at Mellers Primary School on Friday 6th July and at William Booth Primary School on Thursday 12th July. The aim of these sessions was to reinforce the developing relationship between families and Music Service staff and to provide another informal opportunity to learn about the options available to students and how we as a service support progression.

Practice Sessions

The objective of the weekly practice sessions was to provide an opportunity outside of lessons for the targeted students to practice their instrument. Previous feedback had suggested that this is a particular challenge for students where the environment or support is not great at home.

What we learned:

Outputs:

All students attending an ensemble during the summer term – nearly achieved - This was 100% achieved at Mellers Primary School with all 10 of the cohort regularly attending either Area Band or RHYO Connect with an average of 81% attendance. This was achieved for 9 of the 11 William Booth students although as 2 year 5 students failed to attend any of the Area Band sessions in the Summer Term this brought the average attendance down to 62%. In hindsight as these 2 students also failed to engage with the Family Play Sessions we should have probably discounted them from the project. The attendance figure was much higher for the group of year 6s (and one year 5) who all attended RHYO Connect regularly for the last 7 weeks of term – with an average attendance of 88%

All families attending at least one play day – nearly achieved - Nine out of ten of the Mellers Primary School cohort had family members attend the first family play session and six out of ten attended the second. The one student whose family didn't attend either had a very specific reason as working patterns made it impossible for her parents to engage in twilight sessions. Four out of eleven of the students from William Booth had family members attend the first play session and six out of eleven had family members attend the second session – across the two sessions all but two families engaged.

Concert attendance - nine out of ten of the Mellers students attended the service-wide summer celebration event on the 27th June and eight out of nine of them had family members in the audience. Seven out of eleven of the William Booth students attended and four out of eleven had family members in the audience. The William Booth students who performed in the RHYO Connect group at that concert were the first students from the school to ever perform in an ensemble other than Area Band at a service-wide event.

Exams taken – 100% of the Mellers students took their grade 1, 2 or 3 exams in July and 73% of the William Booth students took their grade 1 exam

Resources – resources such as flashcards, presentations, info sheets, and musical games were created for the family play sessions

Outcomes

Increased understanding of opportunities by families

Each of the play sessions provided information for families presented in a variety of ways including quizzes, and presentations. This covered areas such as ensemble opportunities, teaching provision at secondary school, instrument loan service, fees and subsidies available, contact details for secondary school music teachers as well as more general information on the exam system, musical learning and how students progress, and the wider impact of music education. Therefore the information was certainly provided and anecdotal feedback given to the external evaluator Susanne Burns and to the FSWs has been that this has had the desired effect. Feedback on the online surveys should provide more information on this.

Improved engagement by families

As is illustrated by the output statistics above, engagement by families has certainly improved. This includes engagement with service staff and service events but also engagement with school. At least one student in the William Booth cohort and one student in the Mellers cohort have families who historically have not had a positive relationship with school so their engagement with the project is all the more impressive.

Improved relationship between NMS and families

Possibly an ‘improved relationship’ was not the most accurate description for this outcome as there hasn’t been any evidence of a negative relationship in the past more a lack of relationship. In developing the project we were keen to build relationships and trust directly between families and the service rather than just using the school as a ‘middle man’ as obviously, this role would cease at the end of year 6. Therefore, the play sessions were designed to introduce families to music service staff in an informal and friendly way helping to build that relationship. To that end I feel it was certainly successful, feedback on the online surveys may explore this more.

Creation of music-making peer groups and support networks in individual schools

Feedback from the year 6s interviewed during the project indicates that they already feel they have a very supportive music-making peer group although this is one based at school where they all learn together as a class. Building a similarly supportive network out of school will take longer than the 6 or 7 weeks the students have been attending ensembles but initial evidence is very positive.

More secondary age students attending out of school ensembles from September 2018

We will be tracking the year 6s in September and will be able to report on this outcome more accurately in the autumn term.

Key Learning

Family Support Worker role –the FSW role has been crucial for the project. During the project it also became apparent how important it is that the FSW is already known to the families; has an in-depth understanding of the school, staff, and structures; is confident in relationship building; has some musical understanding, is practical and pragmatic yet enthusiastic and committed and has ingenuity and creativity by the bucket load! Being able to think on their feet and make timely suggestions has massively improved the outcomes and outputs of the project.

Play session structure – these sessions were designed to be informative but more importantly friendly and encouraging. The principal objective was about building relationships rather than anything else. We learned therefore that the format should be informal and include participatory activities rather than a presentation type style – with team games, flashcards, quizzes etc to provide information and provoke questions rather than a presentation and Q & A style approach. We also learned that parents at each school differed in their confidence to engage with the school and that William Booth parents were more reticent to engage and seemingly more intimidated by some of the activities. Providing child care for siblings (those too young to engage with the activities) was also important to help nervous parents engage with activities

Engagement with Music Service and School – as the project was being coordinated by a freelance project manager for the Music Service and a FSW (who were contracted TAs) in each school there was some separation between the project and the wider organisations. The project was engaged with wider service objectives such as the exam strategy, events, and transition and the project manager attempted to ensure integration as much as possible. However, at times, there was some confusion in communication – for examples summer concert letters being distributed centrally by the Music Service rather than through the FSW which had proved a more fruitful channel for our cohort. Similarly, there have been initiatives and events at each school that the project could have engaged with quite productively if there had been a stronger link to the class teachers. For example the classroom drop-in sessions at Mellers and links to parents evening and the family café initiative at William Booth. In addition, more persistent support from the class teachers could have helped with the initial recruitment at William Booth, where the FSW was less known to families - for example letters weren't handed out to year 5 families until the day before the first play session.

Supervision and Transport – the attendance rate for the year 6s at RHYO Connect was extremely high over the 7 weeks – 88%. Whilst the attendance rate for the year 5s was much lower at 51%, even if you remove the 2 William Booth students who didn't attend any sessions the rate is still only 64%. Although there are some complicating factors I think the fact that the FSW rounded the children up and physically transported them to and from the RHYO Connect sessions made a big difference to the attendance rate.

What didn't work

Participating Schools – we had originally intended to work with 3 of our In Harmony Gold schools on this pilot programme, however, following extensive discussion, we decided not to pursue the third school as they couldn't identify an internal candidate for the FSW role. We felt that it was so important that the FSW already have an established relationship with the school that it would be too detrimental to the project to try and recruit someone from outside. Instead, this school and a 4th In Harmony Gold school provided year 6 students to be part of a control group where we met with them and their staff to compile case studies and feedback on their thoughts about the transition.

Transition Meeting – originally we had intended to hold a third family session, this time just with the year 6 families to enable them to meet the secondary music teachers. We felt as personal connection was such an important factor in continuation that we needed to facilitate that. However, the timing proved impossible and we weren't able to get all the relevant teachers to a meeting at the busy end of the term. This was particularly challenging due to the number of different schools involved.

Communication – as mentioned above the link between the project and wider service initiatives could have been slightly clearer and in future, we will ensure that any communication with the specific cohort comes through the Family Support Worker rather than directly from the service. On a different note, communication with schools needed a bit more lead-in time, particularly with the setting of dates and booking of rooms.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the most successful elements of the project have been:

- The Family Support Worker role
- The informal, personal nature of the family play sessions
- Getting families to events to see the student's progress first hand
- The teamwork between FSW, Music Service staff and project manager
- Being able to trial approaches with small cohorts in extremely committed schools and taking risks

Recommendations for this project moving forward would be:

- Integrate the project more solidly within school and service
- Set dates well in advance
- Continue to hold 2 play sessions but with one at the beginning of the year to welcome parents and introduce the project and one in the early summer term to focus on exams, performances and what next.
- Extend the reach of the project into year 4, even if in a minor way such as inviting year 4 parents to observe a session.
- Reduce the 'presentation' elements of the play sessions even further replacing with a more active quiz approach.
- Provide creche facilities for much younger siblings who might prevent a parent from engaging fully

What we plan to do next

Using Music Hub funding we intend to continue the project in William Booth and Mellers Primary Schools into next academic year, although on a scaled down basis - including tracking the participation rates of the new year 7s. We will continue to contract the Family Support Workers in each school, although for half the weekly hours, to enable them to continue supervising the year 6s to attend the weekly RHYO Connect sessions, liaise with families and hold the weekly practice sessions. We also intend to apply for Youth Music funding to expand the number of schools involved and reinstate the play sessions in the future.

In addition, there is great potential to roll out this approach and whilst not every element would work in every school there are some clear opportunities:

- Initiate family engagement when students start their whole class or In Harmony lessons in year 4 – this could be light touch such as an open invitation to observe a session or a letter home etc but would ensure some level of contact between families and the music service from the very start.
- Send transition information directly to families with contact details of secondary school music teachers and information on how to access instrumental loans, ensembles and out of school teaching.
- Provide open rehearsal sessions of service-wide events such as the Great Orchestra Experiment to give families an inside view of inspiring opportunities.
- Extend the RHYO Intermediate Orchestra summer schools tour to include invitations to parents/carers and information on teaching, ensemble and instrument loans.
- Roll out a less intensive Family Support Worker model for *In Harmony* Gold or Silver schools where an identified member of staff is paid a small retainer to encourage ensemble

participation and coordinate communication with families of year 5 and year 6 students – this could be match funded by the schools.

Appendix Seven

***In Harmony* Stoke**

Aims:

We aimed to create an *In Harmony* Orchestra where pupils involved in the programme have the opportunity to play out of curriculum time. We had identified this need by the limited number of young people from our programme who were engaging in out of school music opportunities. City Music Service has a wide range of free music ensembles that have been advertised to *In Harmony* Stoke pupils but only a very small number of young people have attended. As the vast majority of students are starting their musical learning at beginner level then the correct ‘musical level’ group for them to join would be working with young people from much younger year groups. Some of the resistance to the programme from students and school staff at the end of Year 1 was that certain aspects of the programme (eg Halle Come and Play event) were too ‘primary level’ for KS3 students. The programme had already identified this as a development area to look at expanding out of school opportunities. We wanted to focus on a mix of instruments, seeking to generate fun musical learning as the activity was out of school curriculum time and pupils were attending voluntarily.

What we did:

The school music department and *In Harmony* programme have struggled to date with the engagement of pupils in out of school activities when opportunities are advertised to full year groups. Therefore a different strategic approach was identified and *In Harmony* delivery team were asked to identify a number of students in each class who would benefit from involvement in the programme. Each of these students was presented with a ‘golden ticket’ personalised invitation to the orchestra. This was very successful with an excellent first rehearsal. Unfortunately, snow the following week disrupted the flow of the rehearsals.

On receiving confirmation of funding, as part of a meeting with Holly Hartley, Principal, recruitment for the orchestra was discussed. The school does already have a number of other after school clubs so timetabling was key to not clash with other clubs. This has still had to be the case due to starting the orchestra part way through the school year.

The project needed the involvement of *In Harmony* and school staff. We issued invitation letters to those we were inviting to attend. We identified pupils who needed extra support or encouragement to attend, secured peer support and encouragement.

What we learned:

The project provided additional opportunities for young people to develop and enhance their *In Harmony* learning. We observed a change in some pupils now seeing music as a hobby and leisure activity not just a curriculum activity.

Some of the pupils who attend have been shy in lessons and needed extra encouragement to attend. The golden ticket acted as a great incentive and it was fantastic to welcome some students to the orchestra who have not engaged in other out of school opportunities.

The project increased the profile of *In Harmony* programme across the Academy, staff and students. Music is now seen as a holistic activity offering support with student wellbeing.

Due to the range of instruments and ability level, the repertoire has had to be arranged and flexibility of instrumentation has been needed.

Feeder primary school pupils who already play instruments were identified and these students will be targeted in September on joining the school. The timing of the orchestra and location of the school in relation to feeder primary schools is a barrier. Feedback from pupils/ school staff was that the orchestra was progressing students' musical and social skills and this would change with addition of younger year groups.

We believe that this is an effective way to support progression – the majority of pupils do not take instruments home to practice so the orchestra has supported young people in choosing *In Harmony* as a Year 9 option.

A weekly register has been taken and the total number of students attending has been 42 with 12 students attending very regularly. There was a marked decrease in students attending after the school holidays when the week commitment/ habit/ routine needed to be re-established. This is an area that has been identified for more support in the future.

The orchestra has given students a new sense of identity, purpose and context for their musical learning. There is a new understanding of musicianship and ensemble skills because students are working with different peers within their own year group and different year groups within the school. It has developed the overall identity of the programme.

A number of school staff who have played as part of the programme have attended sessions and this has helped to promote the In Harmony programme across faculties within the Academy.

What we plan to do next:

The school has received funding to continue this pilot programme and so the orchestra will be expanded in September 2018. This is a fantastic legacy to the progression funding.

The orchestra students were selected to attend and represent the school at Halle Come and Play event and they will be attending a lunchtime recital given by pupils of Newcastle-under-Lyme school as part of Penkhull Festival on Friday 21 September.

Appendix Eight

***In Harmony* Telford**

Aims:

We were seeking to create a more cohesive community of young people committed to an ensemble. We wanted targeted young people to have increased engagement with *In Harmony* so they built new friendship groups and became more committed before leaving their primary school at the end of Year 6. We piloted a specific targeted intervention during school time, with a 4 day time commitment from the children.

What we did:

Three members of *In Harmony* staff and a tutor from the Royal Birmingham Conservatoire led 2 rehearsal days. This led to a trip to Royal Birmingham Conservatoire which included a coaching session with the Head of Strings plus a public performance in the bar area.

We followed this with a day of performances including two performances in care homes, one performance at a community dinner for older people and one assembly performance to share with the school community. There was also a performance at the end of year concert. Music was arranged and composed specific to the levels and needs of the targeted children. It was designed to push the children playing in the ensemble. The intensive nature of the days was intended to cause a bond to be formed between members of the ensemble who are not necessarily in friendship groups.

What we learned:

Project outputs were six performances including one at Royal Birmingham Conservatoire and 3 external concerts.

The outcomes were that twelve children equally or more engaged with *In Harmony* and have stated that they wish to continue with music post year 6. Confidence levels were raised and musical progression was observed. Children engaged with each other on a different level and also engaged with older people from care settings.

Unexpected outcomes included the fact that two of the children invited to be part of the project left after the first morning, and it took a while to discover why. The reason was that SATS were over and they had all discovered which schools they were going to. They wanted to make the most of their remaining time at primary school with their classmates and friends.

Although post-SATS works well for this sort of project, there is a window of time before secondary school places are allocated and it may be that this is a better time to really engage the year 6 cohort.

The things that worked well were:

- the intensity;
- the idea of being selected especially, the idea of it being voluntary,
- the fairly substantial scale of the project and commitment required - 4 days, 5 performances,
- the inspirational nature of the project,
- the idea of coming together and bonding as a group.

However, the timing of the project was not as successful and we would not do it again at this time. If it is delivered earlier in the year we feel it would be an effective means of supporting progression. It is a relatively inexpensive model for the important engagement outcomes. It could have run with fewer staff if necessary, but the quality of interaction was of benefit. We will be trying to find funding to continue a similar model in the future.

Appendix 9

Job specification for Family Support Worker

Supporting Progression to KS3 from In Harmony Primaries (Roads to RHYO) – Pilot Project Family Support Worker Role – Mellers Primary School

The Role

The Mellers Family Support Worker (FSW) will be central to the success of this project. They will act as the central information and support point for the cohorts of pupils and their families. With support from Nottingham Music Service teaching staff they will facilitate the following activities:

- Monthly twilight sharing events for families and siblings of targeted pupils
- attendance at Area Band and RHYO Connect (including transporting the targeted pupils to and from sessions)
- weekly practice sessions for pupils struggling to practice at home
- regular communication with families providing information, encouragement and celebration

Time Commitment

The FSW at Mellers Primary School will need to commit to the following:

RHYO Connect Sessions – transporting and supervising the 5 pupils to attend the Music School concert on Tuesday 1st May and then supervising attendance at RHYO Connect each week for 6 weeks from Monday 14th May. Each session runs 4 – 5.30pm at College Street but pupils will need supervising from 3.15pm and until returned home at approximately 6pm making a total 2hrs and 45 minutes each session. Total 19.25 hrs (over 7 weeks)

Area Band Sessions – supervising Mellers pupils attending Area Band each Thursday from 3.15 – 5.15pm at school – this will include the identified year 5s from the Roads to RHYO project. The first session will be Thursday 26th April and continue for the following 9 weeks. Total 18 hrs (over 9 weeks)

Weekly practice sessions – supervising weekly practice sessions for the 10 identified pupils (potentially 30 mins for year 5s and 30 mins for year 6s) to start from w/c 23rd April at a time to be agreed and continue for the remaining 12 weeks of term. Total of 12 hrs (over 12 weeks)

Family Play Sessions – 1.5 hr twilight sessions for pupils and families will take place on May 2nd and the at a date to be confirmed in June and then again in July (although the July session will be for year 6 pupils only). Total 4.5 hrs

General admin – approximately 1 hour per week for various liaison/communication with pupils, parents, teaching staff, NMS teaching staff and NMS project manager. Total of 13 hours (over 13 weeks).

All of the above will add up to a total of 66hrs and 45 minutes during the summer term. In addition up to 3 hours can be used at the beginning of the autumn term to track continuation of pupils into secondary school.

Any further continuation of the role is pending confirmation of further funding.

Person specification

The Family Support Worker will:

- Already have a relationship with school staff and a good understanding of how the school works.
- Have good communication skills and the ability to build a rapport with individual pupils and their families.

- Have the required initiative to become the key link person in school liaising with pupils, families, school staff and NMS staff and identifying and responding appropriately to opportunities and challenges.
- Be able to adequately supervise a group of pupils during practice sessions and during RHYO Connect and Area Band sessions (including supervising any ‘spare time’ and transporting them to and from the rehearsals)
- Be able to host sharing sessions at school, providing a friendly welcome to families and liaising with key staff in the development and delivery of the sessions.

Timetable

April 2018

- Family Support Workers (FSW) recruited in each school
- Cohort of pupils agreed
- Weekly practice sessions start in each school
- Year 6 students start attending RHYO Connect, Year 5 pupils start attending Area Band – both supported by FSW

May 2018

- First family play/sharing event held for cohort and parents/carers/siblings
- Ongoing practice sessions and ensemble attendance

June 2018

- Ongoing practice sessions and ensemble attendance
- Second family play/sharing event
- Summer term performances – RHYO Connect/Area Band/RHYO Intermediate

July 2018

- Third family play/sharing event – including plans for year 6s post transition

September 2018

- FSW Tracks students into year 7 (any further support at ensembles dependent on further funding)

Contractual Arrangements

The FSW will continue to be contracted by Mellers Primary School who will invoice NMS for the additional hours.